

2018

ACTES DU SJPD – JPDS PROCEEDINGS



**JEAN-PAUL DIONNE
SYMPOSIUM**

ET SI...

WHAT IF...

ET SI... RÉINVENTER L'ÉDUCATION POUR
TRANSFORMER L'APPRENTISSAGE,
L'ENSEIGNEMENT ET LA CONNAISSANCE

WHAT IF... REIMAGINING EDUCATION TO
TRANSFORM LEARNING, TEACHING, AND KNOWING

ACTES DU SYMPOSIUM JEAN-PAUL DIONNE
JEAN-PAUL DIONNE SYMPOSIUM PROCEEDINGS
2018, VOL. 2 (ISSN: 2561-4878)

POUR SOUMMETTRE UNE ARTICLE OU UNE DEMANDE/
TO SUBMIT AN ARTICLE OR AN INQUIRY

CONTACT

Symposium Jean-Paul Dionne / Jean-Paul Dionne Symposium
sjpdjpbs@uottawa.ca
<https://www.sjpd-jpbs.org/en/>

Actes du SJPD-JPDS Proceedings
<https://uottawa.scholarsportal.info/ottawa/index.php/sjpd-jpbs/index>

Faculté d'éducation / Faculty of Education
Université d'Ottawa / University of Ottawa
Lamoureux Hall (LMX)
145 Jean-Jacques-Lussier Private, # 143.
Ottawa, Ontario, CANADA, K1N 6N5



CONTENUS / CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION

Un message de la vice-doyenne à la recherche	1
A Message from the Vice-Dean, Research	2
Un message des éditeurs	3
A Message from the Editors	4
Reconnaissance du territoire / Land Acknowledgement	5
Remerciements / Acknowledgements	6

ARTICLES

Lauren Delcourt <i>Elitist, Inequitable and Exclusionary Practices: A Problem within Ontario French Immersion Programs?</i>	7
Rana Elbeshbeishy <i>Finding the Right Balance: Integrating Old and New Approaches for Anatomy Teaching</i>	27
Billie Jane Hermosura <i>Teaching Future Dietitians Leadership: A General Needs Assessment</i>	45
Erin Roach <i>Connection Failure: Systemic Disadvantages Facing the LGBTQ+ Community in Therapy and How to Address Them</i>	63
Taciana de Lira e Silva <i>Critical Cosmopolitan Citizenship Education and the Ontario Curriculum</i>	77

INFORMATION

Contributeurs / Contributors	97
Équipe éditoriale / Editorial Team	101



UN MESSAGE DE LA VICE-DOYENNE À LA RECHERCHE

Mars, 2019

Chers lecteurs,

Annuellement, le Symposium Jean Paul Dionne fait rayonner les recherches produites par des étudiants aux cycles supérieurs. L'objectif du Symposium est d'offrir aux étudiants l'opportunité de faire connaître leurs idées. En particulier, publier au sein des Actes du Symposium aide les étudiants à développer leur confiance d'auteur, les initie à la transformation d'une présentation orale en article scientifique, ainsi que leur permet de répondre aux commentaires issus de la révision par les pairs. La production des Actes implique d'autres étudiants aux cycles supérieurs, qui acquièrent de l'expérience en tant qu'évaluateurs au sein d'un processus de révision par les pairs en deux étapes.

Ultimement, nous croyons que le Symposium Jean Paul Dionne et les Actes qui en découlent contribuent au réseautage d'idées et de personnes de manière à renforcer la communauté académique qui soutient notre travail.

Je tiens à remercier les évaluateurs des articles publiés ainsi que les éditeurs des Actes, Fiona Cooligan, Raphaël Gani et Billie Jane Hermousa, pour leur dévouement.

Christine Suurtamm

Vice-doyen à la recherche et au développement professionnel
Faculté d'éducation, Université d'Ottawa

A MESSAGE FROM THE VICE-DEAN, RESEARCH

March 2019

Dear readers,

The Jean-Paul Dionne Symposium occurs annually to support and enhance graduate student research. The goal of the symposium is to help students network their ideas. These proceedings further that cause. These proceedings in particular, help to develop students' authorial confidence by engaging them in the publication process, which includes transforming a presentation into a written paper, and responding to a peer review process. The proceeding process also provides other graduate students with an opportunity to get experience with and participate in a two-stage peer-review process.

We believe that the Jean Paul Dionne Symposium and this initiative of publications of proceedings helps to network people and ideas to ultimately build a stronger academic community to support our work.

Thanks to the JPDS proceedings' reviewers, and a special thanks to editorial panel of Fiona Cooligan, Raphaël Gani, and Billie Jane Hermousa for all of their hard work to produce these proceedings

Christine Suurtamm

Vice-Dean, Research and Professional Development
Faculty of Education, University of Ottawa

UN MESSAGE DES ÉDITEURS

Voici le deuxième volume des Actes du Symposium Jean-Paul Dionne (JPDS).

Les transformations du monde de l'éducation sont au cœur du thème de l'édition 2018 du Symposium Jean-Paul Dionne, *Et si... on repensait l'éducation pour transformer l'apprentissage, l'enseignement et le savoir*. Les participants étaient invités à reconsidérer leurs savoirs à lumière des changements sociétaux, culturels et politiques. Ces changements nous entraînent à réimaginer l'éducation, en renouvelant les philosophies et les méthodes d'enseignement, les méthodologies de recherche ainsi que la pédagogie.

À travers un programme de communications orales, d'ateliers ainsi que de tables rondes, les participants au Symposium devaient contempler les limites du monde de l'éducation afin d'imaginer des voies de passage vers le futur. Plusieurs étudiants diplômés ayant offert des communications orales ont aussi soumis des articles pour les Actes au sein d'un processus de révision par les pairs et par des professeurs de la Faculté. Les cinq articles publiés dans le présent volume des Actes constituent une riche collection de projets de recherche qui explore des pratiques innovantes pour repenser l'éducation.

Un premier article présente les mérites d'une éducation à la citoyenneté cosmopolite et critique en tant qu'approche transformative pour faire face aux défis du 21^e siècle. Deux autres articles focalisent sur les professions de la santé, notamment par une enquête au sujet de pratiques innovantes en enseignement de l'anatomie; ou, en détaillant l'enjeu du leadership chez les diététistes. Enfin, le traitement des groupes marginalisés est le sujet de deux articles, un portant sur les obstacles systémiques vécus par les clients LGBTQ+ en thérapie de santé mentale; l'autre article porte sur les pratiques élitistes, inéquitables et discriminantes ayant cours dans les programmes de Français langue seconde en Ontario.

Nous aimerions remercier la vice-doyenne à la recherche et au développement professionnel de la Faculté d'éducation de l'Université d'Ottawa, le comité organisateur du Symposium en 2018, ainsi que les personnes qui ont contribué à la production des Actes.

Nous vous invitons à lire le travail de vos collègues en espérant que cela vous inspire à repenser vos conceptions de l'enseignement, de l'apprentissage ainsi que de la connaissance en éducation. Si vous êtes un étudiant diplômé participant au Symposium en 2019, veuillez considérer la possibilité de soumettre un article pour les Actes.

Fiona Cooligan
Co-Éditeur

Raphaël Gani
Co-Éditeur

Billie Jane Hermosura
Co-Éditeur

A MESSAGE FROM THE EDITORS

Welcome to the second volume of the Jean-Paul Dionne Symposium (JPDS) Proceedings.

The 2018 JPDS theme, *What If... Reimagining Education to Transform Learning, Teaching & Knowing*, built on the momentum of previous years, by exploring opportunities and strategies to transform education. Participants were invited to consider possibilities for transformation across society, culture, economy, and politics, in order to challenge traditional ways of knowing. These transformations require us to reimagine our understanding of educational frameworks, teaching methods, approaches to educational research, and the development of pedagogies. Through a dynamic program of presentations, workshops and round tables, the Symposium challenged attendees to contemplate the current limits of education and to envision alternative possibilities.

Several of the graduate students who presented at the Symposium also prepared and submitted articles for the peer-reviewed JPDS 2018 Proceedings. The articles published in this issue constitute a rich collection of research projects that explore innovative practices with a view to reconceptualizing education.

One paper considers the merits of critical cosmopolitan education as a transformational approach to addressing complex global challenges in the 21st century. Two other papers explore the “What If...” theme within the context of health professions education, one by investigating innovative approaches to anatomy teaching in medicine, and the other by examining the need for leadership development in dietetics. The treatment of marginalized groups is examined in a paper on systemic disadvantages facing the LGBTQ+ community in therapy, and in another that critically discusses elitist, inequitable and exclusionary practices in Ontario French immersion programs.

We would like to thank the Vice-Dean of Research, the JPDS 2018 Organizing Committee, and all of the reviewers for the invaluable contributions of their time, expertise, and dedication.

We invite you to read your colleagues’ work and hope you will be inspired to challenge your own understanding of teaching, learning and knowing. If you are a graduate student who presented at the 2019 Jean-Paul Dionne Symposium, please consider submitting a paper for the 2019 JPDS Proceedings.

Fiona Cooligan
Co-Editor

Raphaël Gani
Co-Editor

Billie Jane Hermosura
Co-Editor

RECONNAISSANCE DU TERRITOIRE / LAND ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

Afin de renouveler les activités savantes traditionnelles, telles que les conférences universitaires, et pour mieux s'aligner sur les préceptes de la réconciliation, il est important de reconnaître que le symposium a eu lieu sur un territoire algonquin non cédé.

With the intention to continuously reimagine traditional scholarly activities, such as academic conferences, to better align with and support truth and reconciliation, it is important to acknowledge that the symposium took place on unceded Algonquin territory.

Ni manàdjiyànànig Màmìwininì Anishinàbeg, ogog kà nàgadawàbandadjig iyo akì eko weshkad. Ako nongom ega wikàd kì mìgiwewàdj.

Ni manàdjiyànànig kakina Anishinàbeg ondaje kaye ogog kakina eniyagizidjig enigokamigàg Kanadàng eji ondàpinangig endàwàdjìn Odàwàng.

Ninisidawinawànànig kenawendamòdjig kije kikenindamàwin; weshkinìgidjig kaye kejeyàdizidjig. Nigijeweninmànànig ogog kà nìgànì sòngideyedjig; weshkad, nongom; kaye àyànikàdj.

Nous rendons hommage au peuple algonquin, gardien traditionnel de cette terre. Nous reconnaissons le lien sacré de longue date l'unissant à ce territoire qui demeure non cédé. Nous rendons également hommage à tous les peuples autochtones qui habitent Ottawa, qu'ils soient de la région ou d'ailleurs au Canada.

Nous reconnaissons les gardiens des savoirs traditionnels, jeunes et âgés.

Nous honorons aussi leurs courageux dirigeants d'hier, d'aujourd'hui et de demain.

We pay respect to the Algonquin people, who are the traditional guardians of this land. We acknowledge their longstanding relationship with this territory, which remains unceded.

We pay respect to all Indigenous people in this region, from all nations across Canada, who call Ottawa home.

We acknowledge the traditional knowledge keepers, both young and old.

And we honour their courageous leaders: past, present, and future.

REMERCIEMENTS / ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

L'équipe d'éditeurs des Actes tient à remercier le comité organisateur du symposium Jean-Paul Dionne (JPDS) 2018. Sans leurs efforts, les Actes n'auraient pas vu le jour. Le Symposium s'est déroulé sur deux jours et a attiré le plus grand nombre de participants à ce jour tout en permettant aux étudiants diplômés de partager leur travail de recherche et d'apprendre les uns des autres.

The editorial team would like to recognize the 2018 Jean-Paul Dionne Symposium (JPDS) Committee for planning the 10th annual symposium. The 2-day event, held at the University of Ottawa on March 1st and 2nd 2018, attracted the largest number of attendees to-date. It provided graduate students with the opportunity to share their burgeoning research work and to learn from one another in a supportive academic setting.

Carolyn Hebert, Co-présidente / Co-chair

Leva Rouhani, Co-présidente / Co-chair

Billie Jane Hermosura, Membre / Member

Annette Jubril, Membre / Member

Marie-Philip Mathieu, Membre / Member

Jessica Macdonald, Membre / Member

Les éditeurs des Actes 2018 aimeraient souligner la tenue de l'édition 2019 du Symposium Jean-Paul Dionne le 7 et 8 mars à l'Université d'Ottawa. Le thème de cette année, *Bâtir des futures équitables*, se veut une invitation à considérer la manière dont l'éducation contribue à l'équité tant pour les individus que pour les communautés. Nous invitons les participants au Symposium à soumettre leur communication orale sous la forme d'un article scientifique pour [la prochaine édition des Actes](#).

The 2018 JPDS Proceedings team would also like to call attention to the 2019 Jean-Paul Dionne Symposium taking place at the University of Ottawa on March 7th and 8th, 2019. The theme of this year's Symposium, "Building Equitable Futures", is an invitation to consider how education can contribute to building equitable futures for individuals and communities. We invite all presenters to submit a paper to the 2019 JPDS Proceedings. Stay tuned to the [JPDS Proceedings website](#) for a call for papers following the symposium for guidelines on submitting.

Elitist, Inequitable and Exclusionary Practices: A Problem within Ontario French Immersion Programs?

A Literature Review

Lauren Delcourt
University of Ottawa

The 2013 Ontario French Second Language (FSL) Curriculum emphasizes inclusivity and bilingualism; however, many students are recommended to opt out of French Immersion (FI). The opting-out of students may support the strengthening of the program by establishing a reputation of success, but how does it affect the withdrawn child? Are FSL programs using best practices to support all learners equitably, or catering to the elite students as a result of misconceptions, lack of resources and professional training? To address these questions, an exploratory and focused literature review of Canadian publications, Ministry of Education documentations and global articles on the topic of bilingualism was conducted, focusing on the works of Genesee (2007) and Baker (2006) on natural language acquisition, Arnett and Mady (2017) on teachers' and parents' perspectives, and Gour (2015) and Wise (2012) who report on misconceptions regarding second language education. Emerging trends indicate that elitist practices and unequal access to FSL programs remain a prominent issue in Ontario classrooms. With the understanding that students with learning disabilities (LDs) can succeed in the FI program, removing these learners may in turn, be a disservice to their overall learning. Findings presented in this paper support the need to examine how learners' abilities are being perceived by educational professionals to provide the necessary tools and supports for success, appropriate training to mitigate misconceptions, as well as retain a reputation for success in FSL programs through equitable means. Acknowledging such discrepancies between what serves as best teaching practice and making it possible in the classroom is necessary to reduce excuses of unpreparedness to meet students' diverse needs and initiate reflection and training programs that prepare teachers to teach inclusively to all.

Keywords: *French second language, inclusive, French immersion, learning disabilities, language acquisition, bilingual*

Le programme ontarien de Français Langue seconde (2013; FLS) que suivent les élèves en immersion focalise sur l'inclusion et le bilinguisme. Or, des intervenants du milieu scolaire encouragent plusieurs étudiants à quitter l'immersion française. Cet abandon préserve possiblement la réputation de succès attribué à l'immersion, mais de quelle manière cet abandon affecte-t-il l'étudiant qui abandonne? Le programme FLS s'inspirent-ils de pratiques éprouvées de manière à garantir un traitement équitable pour tous les étudiants, ou plutôt, s'emploie-t-il à répondre aux besoins des étudiants performants dus à des conceptions erronées, aux manques de ressources ainsi que de formation professionnelle. Pour répondre à cette question, une revue de littérature a été produite, de manière exploratoire et focalisée sur des documents produits au Canada, notamment par les ministères d'éducation, ainsi que des articles généraux au sujet du bilinguisme, avec une emphase particulière pour les travaux de Genese (2007) et Baker (2006) portant sur l'acquisition naturelle d'une langue, ceux d'Arnett et Mady (2017) au sujet des perspectives parentale et estudiantine, ainsi que les travaux de Gour (2015) et Wise (2012) qui offrent une revue des conceptions erronées ayant trait à l'éducation aux langues secondes. Des tendances émergentes issues de cette revue de littérature indiquent que l'emploi de pratiques élitistes ainsi que d'accessibilité inéquitable est des enjeux important dans les classes en Ontario. Étant donné que les étudiants avec des difficultés d'apprentissage peuvent réussir en classe d'immersion, extraire ces étudiants de l'immersion peut en retour être contre-productif à leur apprentissage. Les résultats présentés dans cet article étayent le besoin d'examiner la manière dont les habilités des apprenants sont perçues par les professionnels de l'éducation, de manière à offrir les outils nécessaires pour assurer le succès, la formation, ainsi que pour contrer leurs conceptions erronées en regard du programme de FLS à travers des moyens équitables. Reconnaître l'écart entre les pratiques souhaitables et ce qui survient en salle de classe est nécessaire pour réduire les manques de préparation quant à la prise en compte des divers besoins des étudiants ainsi que pour initier des programmes de réflexion et de formation pour préparer les enseignants à enseigner l'inclusion pour tous.

Mots-clés : *Français langue seconde, inclusion, immersion française, difficultés d'apprentissage, bilinguisme*

Many parents have been invited into a parent-teacher conference to hear a general message expressing how their child is struggling in the French Immersion (FI) program and that it might be better to move the child to the regular English stream in order to reduce the child's anxiety and support the acquirement of expected grade-level literacy and numeracy skills.

Despite the well-documented success of FI programs in Canada, with 428,625 (Statistics Canada, 2017a) students enrolled in public elementary and secondary FI programs in the 2015-2016 school year, a percentage of those students *opt out* of FI. In the 2016-2017 school year, the Ontario Ministry of Education (OME; 2017) reported that 8,871 grade two students were enrolled in French language programs, however an increasing attrition rate over the academic years produced a decrease of 22% of students by grade eight, with only 6,850 learners enrolled in French language programs.

The school system needs to develop alternatives for parents who have come to terms with the reality that their child may not be succeeding as easily or quickly in the FI program. Providing parents a single alternative option to switch the child into the *regular* English program is often presented as a positive solution that would be best for the child since it would reduce demands and allow them to develop in the areas of concern. Parents coming to terms with the awareness that their child is struggling and that an alternative is being provided may feel encouraged and persuaded by educational professionals to withdraw their child from FI. However, parents are encouraged to think openly and critically about their options, as each situation is unique.

The decision to withdraw a child certainly isn't easy for many parents as bilingualism in Canada has been given such significance over the years and the FI program is commonly known to provide strong second language proficiency. High enrollment in FI additionally supports the impression of a popular and successful program that is appealing to many. While the program accepts all students without any form of entry exam, there remains the possibility of withdrawal, which may perpetuate the idea that the FI program is privileged; or that, if one can be withdrawn, that French instruction is not as important as other subjects, such as English literacy and mathematics proficiency. Furthermore, it is noteworthy to consider how the withdrawal of struggling students may strengthen the FI program overall (by maintaining a higher average from the achievers), but is this a fair outcome for the learner? Were the struggling student's needs met prior to the decision to withdraw them? Furthermore, despite the commonly recognized advantages of learning French in Ontario (e.g., employment opportunities, positions with higher pay, better attention span, multi-tasking skills, networking and social opportunities), the means and methods of learning this language differ based on the educational context. A divide has developed as Core French classrooms fill with students with diverse learning needs (including those who have withdrawn from FI programs), while the FI classroom remains the ideal context for long-term language acquisition (Genesee, 2007), and consequently, achieves great recognition for their production of higher academic achievers. In an education system held to specific

standards of inclusivity, critical reflection and intentional action on the parts of all stakeholders in the field of education in Ontario, is necessary to address this phenomenon within French Second Language (FSL) classrooms to ensure that all learners are accessing the highest quality education.

The first sign of inequality in FSL programs across Canada is that while some students are fortunate to study the language in its most ideal format through FI, others are excluded on the basis that their needs are incompatible with the goals of the FSL curriculum (Arnett & Mady, 2010). Further, the inability of the current FSL program to meet the needs of all students contradicts the reality of other curricular programs that *have* found ways to adequately support students with diverse needs, even with incongruent content to be taught (Arnett & Mady, 2010). Thus, studying the causes and effects regarding practices of exclusion in FSL programs becomes pertinent.

This paper reviews the literature pertaining to how and why elitist and inequitable FSL practices remain a prominent issue in Ontario by reviewing several common misconceptions regarding one's ability to acquire a second language (L2). The paper first examines the Ontario FSL curriculum for its mandate and emphasis on French second language learning and then reviews the role and structure of bilingual education in current Ontario classrooms. The present paper also investigates how streamlining and the existence of separate FSL programs in Ontario may support a hierarchical framework in schools, ultimately creating exclusivity that may result from limited support for students with learning difficulties and misconceptions regarding ability and acquisition of language.

Methodology

The process of reviewing research and publications for this paper first included researching from an initial question surrounding the idea of streamlining students. Specifically, the initial search focused on whether this conundrum regarding student success is either based on *streamlining*, which provides the ideal context for learning and leads to higher success rates (indicating that those who complete the program have learned advanced skills), or whether streamlining is ability-based, where success rates are based on the individual learners in the program (and where students already have within them the ability to succeed and the program supports the learner). This question led to the idea that students are withdrawn in either case, but that the withdrawn students are, for the most part, those with exceptional needs or learning disabilities and those who are English-language learners. Further initial questions included whether everyone can learn a second

language, whether exclusionary practices are being experienced in Ontario, as well as whether there are determined evidence in the literature upon which to base these outcomes.

Thought examining Ministry of Education documents, using personal teaching experience, speaking with teachers, parents and educational administrators, it became apparent that there is a sense of concern with regards to who can and cannot acquire a second language, how students with learning disabilities are (and are not) supported in today's schools, as well as a common expression of wanting more supports and resources available for all FSL learners. With an initial issue to examine, research was accumulated using search terms including: *FSL exclusion*, *learning disabilities*, *language acquisition*, *bilingualism in Canada*, and *French Immersion*.

While some literature on bilingualism and language learning presenting Canada-wide findings or internationally relevant research, such as Baker's (2006) *Foundations of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, were consulted, keeping research specific to the Ontario context was imperative to this literature review. The intention for this paper is to bring together relevant information regarding FSL education in Ontario in order to highlight important areas of concern for which the OME and individual school boards in the province should take note. Additionally, it serves to provide connections and support for teachers and parents when it comes to trying to provide best teaching practices that offer students meaningful and intentional decisions regarding their academic career that is based on research evidence as opposed to misconceptions. The intent is to connect research to practice and provide a basis for teachers and parents to think critically about learners' ability so that instruction is equitable and inclusive.

FSL Ontario Curriculum

The Ontario FSL Grade 1 through 8 Curriculum supports stipulations set by the Canadian Council of Ministers of Education (CMEC) within their *Protocol for Agreements for Minority-Language Education and Second-Language Instruction* (2009). This *Protocol* sets the "outcome frameworks" for primary student participation and the "maintenance, development, enrichment and/or evaluation of programs and innovative teaching approaches for second-language learning" (p. 5). Bilingual programs are acknowledged for their importance and, further, receive funding for FSL services from the Government of Canada (CMEC, 2009). Such funding should support the *Ontario French as a Second Language Curriculum's* overall slogan, as stated on the front cover of curriculum documents, to

“support every child, [and] reach every student” (2013), which prefaces its document with the following claim:

Ontario elementary schools strive to support high-quality learning while giving every student the opportunity to learn in the way that is best suited to his or her individual strengths and needs. [...] The curriculum recognizes that the needs of learners are diverse and helps all learners develop the knowledge, skills, and perspectives they need to become informed, productive, caring, responsible, and active citizens in their own communities and in the world. (p. 3)

With strong emphasis on supporting the needs of all students, it is questionable that in practice struggling learners (i.e., those who have difficulty keeping up with their FSL classmates) withdraw to the English program. This trend is especially concerning despite the Ontario FSL curriculum’s (OME, 2013) direct acknowledgement that “knowledge of an additional language strengthens first-language skills [and the] ability to speak two or more languages generally enhances cognitive development, as well as reasoning and creative-thinking skills” (p. 7). The benefits further outlined in the curriculum include: increased mental flexibility, a better understanding of cultures, greater awareness of global issues, improved problem-solving skills, and expanded career opportunities (OME, 2013).

Any parent interested in registering their child in French immersion can do so if they complete an online application process. While it is not usually a first-come first-served process, schools do have caps on enrollment depending on number of classrooms and teachers. Late applications and those who are not randomly selected are placed on a waitlist. Students who are waitlisted may be placed upon confirmation of school classroom reorganization that takes place leading up to the following school year, may choose to attend a different school, or choose to remain on the waitlist and wait for an opening. Unfortunately, with the popularization of FI as the ideal method of instruction for bilingual learning, many school boards across the province, such as Guelph’s Upper Grand District School Board (Hallett, 2017), are finding it challenging to keep up with the demand. Further, while English classrooms are reducing in size as FI rooms are overfilling with interest, the English rooms are being perceived as the program for students with higher needs, and specifically, for those who have needs that do not fit with those of the FI program. This divide is becoming alarming. Not only do those who withdraw from the program arguably lack the opportunity to expand their skills, but those who are unable to enter the program are also perceiving the connotations each program evokes.

Bilingualism

There is a strong emphasis placed on second language (L2) acquisition in Canada. While the pertinence and benefits are commonly recognized for social and professional gain, bilingual education, according to Baker (2006), can be “a simplistic label for a complex phenomenon” (p. 192). Students are often subject to streaming at young ages, which is the practice of separating children based on age and or ability, causing a widening gap in classroom dynamics between the English *regular* program receiving Core French instruction and the Immersion Program. According to Baker (2006), bilingual education:

will facilitate national cohesion and cultural integration, and enable different language communities inside a country to communicate with each other [...]. For other people, bilingual education will create language factions, national disunity, and cultural and economic and political disintegration. Education has thus been conceived as both part of the solution and part of the problem of achieving national unity, achieving diversity or unity in diversity. (p. 374)

The complexity of bilingual education is recognized across Ontario classrooms as the province is home to a multilingual population with native English and French speakers, as well as immigrants from around the world. In an attempt to offer structure and meet the needs of diverse learners, opportunities are, arguably, simplified to a few options to meet provincially legislated mandates for learning French. Two of these options include the French Immersion Program and the Core French Program. The Core French program “is intended to provide children with a basic level of proficiency in French” (Lazaruk, 2007, p. 606) while the FI programs goes further than teaching just the language arts portion but uses French as the means of instruction for other subject areas, thus providing students a wider range of vocabulary and an active use of the language in order to acquire new knowledge in other areas. In having two options, however, the element of choice is presented as pathways for student success. Parents decide at the beginning of their child’s academic career which program to enroll, each leading to different levels of second language mastery.

Elitist Program

A hierarchy is created with the existence of choice between the Core French and Immersion program. The question of who should and should not study FSL allows for an answer that may restrict one’s access to learning an L2 altogether or deciding which program one should learn from. Arnett and Mady (2010) reference *The Law Society of New Brunswick*,

as well as works by Ryan (2003) and Rushowy (2009), to highlight how this hierarchy of choice may lead to discrimination: “Since 2008, FI programs in several jurisdictions have come under scrutiny, including through legal actions, for their perceived discrimination against certain learner populations, including students with learning difficulties” (p. 20).

Despite the Core French classroom environment showing promise in appropriately supporting students with more complex learning needs (Arnett & Mady, 2010), *how* FI and Core French programs differ in supporting all students should be examined by the OME, as well as whether an element of teacher belief remains that only select learners can succeed in FI classrooms. It may be the case that the school boards do not want to shine light on the lack of support offered to academically low-achieving students in FI, as this reality is based on limitations in staffing qualified French educators. In fact, the challenge of recruiting and retaining qualified FSL teachers across Ontario public schools has been relentless since the early 2000s (Ontario Public School Boards’ Association, 2018). The growing gap between the increasing number of students enrolling in FSL programs and the availability of teachers is certainly problematic when the goal is to make FSL education a possibility for all. Alternatively, perhaps there are challenges with regard to confidentiality and ethics for parents to voluntarily share their experiences regarding the challenges and support (or lack thereof) offered to their child. Speaking up about an issue is challenging. Some parents may not want to expose how their child has struggled. For one parent, sharing the personal story was crucial in informing others of how her son struggled to be included in the FI program. (Mady & Arnett, 2009). Due to having academic struggles, her son was excluded from a program that, in a time of celebrated inclusivity, should be accessible and beneficial to all.

Research over the years has attempted to establish how and why some students struggle in FI, as well as try to classify the precise difficulties that would hinder a student from succeeding in the program. Mady and Arnett (2009) outline three areas in which the educational experience of a student may be affected:

how the processes and policies shaping the identification/diagnosis of learning disabilities contradict the ideals of the inclusion movement, how the status often accorded to the FI program has deterred inclusive efforts, and what research on struggling students in FI does and does not reveal about the connection between student needs and classroom practice. (p. 37-38)

There are several factors that contribute to an overall sense of elitism, as only some students maintain their access to a strong bilingual program that lacks inclusion for all. These factors

include: the complex nature of the paradox of increased enrollment in FSL programs while fewer qualified French teachers enter the workforce, the difficulty to cater to all learning needs in the classroom, the challenge for school boards to balance different FSL programs through Core and Immersion options that offer quite differing learning experiences and end results, as well as the inability to specify the characteristics of learning needs that prescribes a recommendation for withdrawal.

Differing Pathways: Streamlining Students

Streamlining students is a process by which students become grouped based on age, ability, interest, etc. In the case of second language education, students' trajectories follow different paths: either that of the French immersion program or the Core French program. Different views on streamlining exist from different educational and policy vantage points. Depending on the desired outcome and the stakes set for the success of students, the ministry of education, the teacher, the parent and the student may hold differing opinions. From one perspective, it is the initial promise of ability demonstrated at a young age that causes streamlining. For example, Mady and Arnett (2009) found through analysis of emergent skills in young students that "most of the children enrolled in the [FI] program had significantly higher scores on literacy measures than students who would enroll in the Core French language program [... and] children with observable behaviour problems were less likely to enroll in EFI than the other program options" (p. 44). The element of behaviour provides another consideration with regards to streamlining as students can be segregated based on ability or behaviour. Generally, problematic behaviour often indicates that a child is struggling in the classroom (Mady & Arnett, 2009).

From another perspective, the FI program may develop stronger academic abilities within some students, and those who cannot keep up are advised to *opt out*. Streamlining based on ability gives attention, according to Mady & Arnett (2009), "to those students who likely make the biggest academic gains within FI and strengthen its status as the best way to learn French in Canada, [... while] those whose test scores indicated a potential for struggle might be directed elsewhere" (p. 44). This is the case when Ontario students are withdrawn from the FI program and integrated into the Core French program.

Although educators prioritize student learning, various stakeholders, such as program FI administrators, the OME, school board representatives and parent council volunteers, often hold different agendas. If promoting the reputation of success of FI programs is the goal, streamlining would serve to increase overall success rates (e.g., a

successful reputation of the FI program attracts more bright and high-achieving students). The successful reputation thus attracts students from predominantly middle- and upper-middle class backgrounds (Wise, 2012) whose parents recognize the program as one that will better serve to prepare their child and offer advantages for the workforce. The FI program is further enhanced by those with a belief that it remains the ideal context for not only learning the second language but providing stronger aptitude for learning since the learning of other subjects is additionally taught in the second language. While the program is strong and is very successful in many ways, not every child is supported equitably in the program. This creates a form of segregation across socioeconomic backgrounds (Wise, 2012) of those enrolled in FI (based on access to schools offering the program, the availability of teachers qualified in the area, etc.), as well as discourages ESL learners who have immigrated to Canada based on the belief that learning English is already challenging enough (Wise, 2012). Streamlining students between two possible programs for second language acquisition, whether based on ability or promise, provides an illusion of hierarchy that could make one seem more promising. Those that get to maintain their place in the program continue to learn, while others are directed elsewhere. The result becomes that certain student populations are obtaining greater success in language acquisition than others.

Exclusivity

Learning Difficulties

Statistics Canada (2017b) reports that more than 1 in 10 youth, aged 15 to 24, have one or more disabilities; however, according to the Learning Disabilities Association of Ontario (Idao, 2018), “statistics on incidence rates can be particularly vulnerable to distortion or bias for a number of reasons” (n.p.). This is particularly problematic as a consensus on the definition of learning disabilities does not currently exist. This lack of a clear definition can lead to an inability to identify learning disabilities in the educational context. As Lyon et al. (2001) points out, the lack of consensus on a definition for learning disability makes it even harder to identify and ultimately follows a form of “wait to fail” model, where by the time a student’s weaknesses are identified as part of a learning disability, it may be too late to apply interventions to make a significant difference in the child’s experience. The reason why it unfortunately takes longer to identify a learning delay as a learning difficulty is often by virtue of the challenge of identifying whether the difficulty is language- or cognitive-specific. Additionally, when learning disabilities (LD) are hard to define, appropriate interventions and supports are consecutively challenging to develop. Therefore, in many cases, the suggestion of withdrawal arises. However, Arnett and Mady

(2010) raise the important point that FSL programs should be held to the same standard as other educational programs by incorporating the means necessary to implement the mission statement set by the OME for inclusion across all learning programs.

Special education legislation in Ontario and across Canada ensures that each child has access to the general education curriculum, which ensures only a basic French language program (Mady & Arnett, 2009). Even though FI is regarded as the most effective program for developing language proficiency (Genesee, 2007), it is often considered more of an enrichment program than a basic course of study (Mady & Arnett, 2009), which prompts student withdrawal with the implication that FI can be of lesser importance when compared to other subject areas, such as English literacy and mathematics.

There is a consistent lack of special education programs and services provided in the FI setting (Wise, 2012). This illuminates a question of whether the recommendation to opt out is based on student ability or the capacity for the *regular* English stream to provide appropriate and effective support services where the FI stream does not. Wise (2012) highlights that students are withdrawn based on the claims that “(a) the educational needs of exceptional students will be better met in the English program, and (b) the provincial funding model does not permit a full range of special education programs and services in the FI context” (p. 179). In opposition, Wise (2012) asserts that “the first claim has never been substantiated, and the second is false” (p. 179). Yet, officially, no child is *ineligible* for the FI bilingual education program since there is not, and has never been, any provincial screening procedures that determines eligibility for enrolment in FI (Wise, 2012). Therefore, the misconceptions surrounding eligibility and proficiency require reflection and modification in order to become more inclusive of a wider range of students' needs.

Students who are withdrawn from the FI program often continue to struggle. Bruck (1978) found that:

If switched, [children] would have exactly the same problems in an English stream [and that] switching would be detrimental to the child's self-esteem: the child would be marked as not succeeding, would be separated from friends, and would have to readjust to a new social-educational system (p. 52).

Despite being further behind than their peers in English language development and possibly other subject areas since the instruction was previously in an L2 (Bruck, 1978; Lazaruk, 2007), the support they receive is “typically based on an understanding of the child's deficits,

not his/her capabilities” (Mady & Arnett, 2009, p. 41). This perspective, according to Mady and Arnett (2009), can be “pathognomonic, [... as it] views disability as a pathos that is not open to remediation and implicitly argues that strategies and supports will have minimal impact on a child’s growth in the classroom” (p. 41). Furthermore, when students are withdrawn from the FI program and placed in the *regular* English stream with Core French, it is not always to their benefit either. In fact, downgrading to Core French programs may be an additional disservice to those with LDs since “many language-disabled children cannot cope with a typical [FSL] program (typically given for 20-40 minutes a day several times a week); [and ultimately,] leave school with almost no knowledge of French” (Bruck, 1978, p. 70). Bruck (1978) suggests that this problem is based on teaching methods (e.g., a great deal of memory work, repetition of language out of context, the learning of abstract rules), which do not favor to the strengths of students with learning disabilities. Arguably, these students are still receiving FSL instruction, though not as effective, it is in contradiction with the philosophy of inclusion, which emphasizes that all students can achieve success when appropriate supports are available. The lack of consensus of definition of learning disabilities and the fact that, for many students, the transition to the English Program with Core French is not beneficial, there becomes no evident reasons, as highlighted by Wise (2012), to deprive some students from a bilingual education.

Pedagogy and Differentiation

French Immersion is often regarded as an enrichment program (Mady & Arnett, 2009) that goes beyond the basic level of study that is required. Thus, exclusion (the process that occurs when a student is denied access to participate) would exemplify through the inability to maintain a participator in a program that arguably doesn’t meet the needs of that learner. However, if FI is viewed as a program that goes beyond the basic level of study and that Core French is really the minimum requirement, withdrawal from that program tends not to be viewed as a violation of the legal mandates regarding special education. While there may be validity in such logic, it is hard to reconcile that line of thinking with the current climate emphasizing differentiated instruction that is designed to cater to individual learning styles, paces, interests and strengths. Differentiation includes methods such as: grouping students based on ability or interest, designing lessons based on learning styles, adjusting lesson content to meet students’ needs, providing additional resources, and adapting summative tasks/products to demonstrate learning to meet learner needs.

Teachers have the challenge and responsibility to meet every student’s diverse needs. However, supporting all students requires appropriate resources. The “FI program has been

at odds with students with special needs almost since its inception” (Mady & Arnett, 2009, p. 43). With an ongoing lack of resources, support and strategies for differentiation to accommodate all learners, the noteworthy consideration becomes whether those who struggle should transfer to the English program and receive French instruction through the Core Program on the basis that it is the better choice for the student, or whether it is the result of the lack of resources and support systems for the learner in the FI program. Given that two options are available while supports are limited allows a perception that the FI program is, on some level, intended for the academic elite. This perception is further support by the fact that similar logic would not hold for other curricular content. For example, although science or math may be challenging for students, Mady and Arnett (2009) highlight that “when students experience academic challenges [...], they are not removed from those subjects. Supports are extended to the student with the goal of helping [him/her] succeed in the classroom” (p. 45). Unfortunately, it does not help in the case of French second language education that “there has been very little research on the kinds of support that can make immersion more inclusive” (p. 45). Until a change occurs to offer the supports and means necessary to provide differentiated pedagogy and instruction, students struggling with the material will continue the cycle of struggling and facing the decision to opt out of the FI program to the regular English stream, perpetuating these ideas of elitism and exclusion.

Misconceptions

According to the recent findings of Arnett and Mady (2017), “teacher candidates recommended core French as the best context for FSL students with LDs”, a recommendation not based “in their experience or in the program’s ability to have greater success with students with LDs, but due to its lesser demands” (p. 28). According to researchers (e.g., Arnett and Mady, 2017; Genesee, 2007), English Language Learners (ELLs), like students with learning difficulties, can succeed in the FI program when provided with the appropriate supports. Teacher education programs and professional development opportunities need to reflect this sentiment as well as recognize the misconceptions of student ability in order to incorporate into professional practice a drive and understanding that all children can succeed when they have access to the tools, patience and support necessary to do so. The following sections provide an overview of the literature regarding misconceptions about the ability of students with LDs and ELLs.

Ability

According to Baker (2006), “some bilinguals actively speak and write in both languages (productive competence), [while] others are more passive bilinguals and have receptive ability (understanding or reading)” (p. 3). Regardless of type, bilingualism can begin during infancy or during later developmental years. Language acquisition is a process that develops differently from one to another depending on various factors. Baker (2006) notes that for many individuals, language acquisition is generally more rapid for older students in a formal classroom, while those who learn at an early age and continue progressing in developing the language for a number of years “tend to show higher proficiency than those who start to learn the second language later in their schooling” (p. 125). An individual’s age, however, correlates more strongly with the learning situation than the individual’s ability to acquire the language (Baker, 2006). Therefore, beginning the acquisition of second language learning is likely to be more successful when an individual begins acquiring early and continues learning throughout their academic schooling experiences. This ideal case correlates to the French Immersion program that is offered in Ontario schools that allows students to begin acquiring French as a second language in Kindergarten and to continue throughout their secondary years of education.

Negative Impacts on L1 from Learning an L2

Historically, a popular belief has existed that L2 acquisition would negatively affect a child’s L1, especially when most FI students receive little or no instruction in English prior to Grade 3 or 4. Research findings publicized by Swain in 1974, summarized by Lazaruk (2007), states that although “students’ English reading and spelling skills were compromised in comparison to children who had received instruction in English[,] once formal English studies are introduced [...] students make rapid progress in their English reading and writing skills” (p. 613). In practice, these results, as reviewed by Turnbull, Lapkin and Hart (2001), is often recognized by lower grade 3 English literacy scores on Ontario provincial tests completed by students in the FI program, which become significantly higher, even more successful than students in the English program, a few years later when students complete the provincial tests in Grade 6. Lazaruk (2007) further highlights Paradis’ *neurolinguistic theory of bilingualism* (2004) to offer the explanation that:

bilinguals understand each language directly, just as monolinguals do. Rather than translating to themselves in their L1 what they have heard or said in their L2, bilinguals organize their mental representations in accordance with either the

patterns of the first language or those of the second, depending on which is appropriate. Bilinguals thus have the ability to adopt two perspectives, an advantage that enhances general mental capacity and supports alternative ways of considering the same information. (p. 621)

The mental capacity that is developed for language acquisition appears to enhance the neurological ability to complete literacy activities and questions with accuracy.

Immigrants and English Language Learners (ELLs)

Arnett and Mady (2017) highlight that “in some school districts, [ELLs] were either overly restricted from studying FSL [... referred to as an *exemption*] or allowed to enroll in the programs without any noted concerns about their participation” (p. 19). ELLs thus enter the Ontario education program and choose to either follow the recommendation to register in the English stream, with some receiving exemptions from the program altogether, despite the OME’s mandatory French credit necessary for graduation. The rationale, drawn by Arnett and Mady (2017), is that learning two languages at the same time would be far too difficult or impossible. Instead, the belief is that ELLs should first acquire the more prevalent English language. However, it is interesting to examine the research done in this area, such as that of a study completed in Alberta by Swain, Lapkin, Rowen and Hart (1990), which compared assessment in of 200 immigrant grade 8 students who started FI in grade 5 to anglophone students in the regular English program. Their results indicated that the anglophone students were not as successful as the immigrant students, which can be supported, as suggested by Lazaruk (2007), with the explanation that an individual’s first language skills contribute to the development of second language skills.

Conclusion

Bilingual abilities are beneficial to those living and working in Canada and the education system is witnessing the popularity in FSL programs across the country and working to adapt its programming and pedagogies to accommodate the diversity of learners in the classrooms. Canadian education has advanced in its beliefs surrounding language acquisition to acknowledge that learning an L2 would not complicate or delay overall language learning. However, language teachers’ role remains complex in that it needs to provide equality and equity of access to learning for all while supporting and celebrating difference and uniqueness of each individual learner. Further responsibilities include leading each unique learner toward a common goal, in this case, that of acquiring second

language to a degree to which each individual can be successful in their lives. The misconceptions that exist surrounding language acquisition and FSL teaching thus lead to possible ineffectiveness, exclusion and creating an illusion of FSL as inferior, or less important, than other subjects.

The Ontario Curriculum (2013) recognizes the advantages of bilingualism and states its support for FSL programs, yet students are withdrawing from the FI program increasingly every year as they move through the grade levels in Ontario. Thus, the misconceptions surrounding FSL education and the opportunity to learn an L2 should ultimately be based, in agreement with Genesee (2007), on the overall happiness of the student in the program, as well as whether the learner is progressing toward acquisition, regardless of the learner's pace of learning. If a student is having difficulties in the areas of language, reading or other academic subjects taught in the FSL context, then an assessment must be done to determine the supports necessary to encourage and provide access to learning in a way that not only recognizes academic progress, but overall well-being and potential for success across the subject areas. There are some students who find learning in a second language too much of a burden and feel their sense of well-being, confidence and happiness beginning to fall, and in these cases, it is important to recognize the learner as human and make a decision that supports the child most meaningfully. However, those who are happy in the program despite their difficulties, should be encouraged and effectively supported as they have the capacity to learn.

This paper aimed to highlight and connect important issues facing French second language education in Ontario. Exclusionary practices manifest in many forms including: lack of supports and resources provided to teachers, misconceptions not addressed regarding language acquisition, as well as the challenge of schools to keep up with the high demand for bilingual education. An elite perspective of the FI program in the elementary school context emerged, indicating that positive and intentional change must take effect in order to offer all students access to equitable and inclusionary education. Considering the misconceptions surrounding this topic, it is important for educational professionals to reflect on their practice and to acknowledge their own biases. Further, it is also beneficial to continue research into developing a deeper understanding of how students differ in language proficiency acquisition, as well as developing models of identification and intervention for those who are struggling.

Although the present literature review provided a window into the education field's current knowledge on Ontario's FI programs, questions inevitably remain, such as: which

factors are unique to second language learning difficulties? How can resources be developed and shared that would scaffold and differentiate support to students struggling specifically in FI? Which essential elements must be incorporated into teacher training to clarify and define language acquisition and proficiency development to prepare teachers to support all learners inclusively? Further recommendations to benefit equitable FSL instruction could include, for instance, having a designated professional to offer unbiased input into whether it is in a child's best interest to withdraw from FI. This way, an objective perspective could provide a basis for validating whether a child truly is not a good candidate for learning in a FI context where all subjects are taught in the second language.

It is not only the action of educational professionals and researchers that makes change possible. Rather, it must be acknowledged that "inaction on the part of multiple FI stakeholders (e.g. government officials, parents, and educators) to move toward more inclusionary practices constitutes a 'conspiracy' of silence which limits access to FI programs to the English-speaking academic elite from higher socioeconomic backgrounds" (Wise, 2012, p. 178). Discriminatory practice evolves from the lack of change in the current FSL program that is not presently able to successfully provide equitable access to special education programs and services to all. Students enter the classroom with a range of backgrounds, interests and needs and are entitled access to education stipulated by the provincial ministry of education, which currently stipulates an importance for second language French instruction.

As authors and researchers, Wise, Mady and Arnett, strongly advocate (through their numerous publications and initiatives) for equity in FSL education in Ontario. This paper intends to provide an additional motivation for change in making equity possible in every school across the province. Inaction must be replaced with directed action to gather resources and support for differentiation and inclusive practices for all students. The excuse that "FSL teachers are unprepared to meet the needs of students with diverse learning needs" (Arnett & Mady, 2010, p. 32) must end in order to alleviate the sense of elitism and exclusion associated with the FI program in Ontario.

References

- Arnett, K., & Mady, C. (2017). Core or immersion? Canadian French-second-language teacher candidates' perceptions and experiences of the best and worst program options for students with learning difficulties and for English language learners. *Exceptionality Education International*, 27(1), 17-37.
- Arnett, K., & Mady, C. (2010). A critically conscious examination of special education within FSL and its relevance to FSL teacher education programs. *The Canadian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 13(1), 19-36.
- Baker, C. (2006). *Foundations of bilingual education and bilingualism*. (4th ed.). Clevedon, UK: Multilingual Matters.
- Bruck, M. (1978). The Suitability of Early French Immersion Programs for the Language-Disabled Child. *Canadian Journal of Education*, 3(4), 51-72.
- Council of Ministers of Education, Canada. (2009). *Protocol for agreement for minority language education and second-language instruction, 2009-2010 to 2012-2013 between the Government of Canada and the Council of Ministers of Education, Canada*. Her Majesty the Queen in Right of Canada. Retrieved from <https://www.cmec.ca/Publications/Lists/Publications/Attachments/211/protocol-for-agreements-2009-2013.pdf>
- Genesee, F. (2007). French immersion and at-risk students: A review of research evidence. *Canadian Modern Language Review*, 63(5), 655-687.
- Gour, R. (2015). Engagement or despondence? Ontario middle-school core French teachers' perceptions of and experiences with the 2013 Ontario French as a second language curriculum (Doctoral dissertation). Retrieved from https://tspace.library.utoronto.ca/bitstream/1807/70346/1/Gour_Rochelle_201511_MA_thesis.pdf
- Hallett, D. (2017). Demand for French Immersion in Guelph far exceeds board cap. *Guelph Mercury Tribune*. Metroland Media Group Ltd. Retrieved from <https://www.guelphmercury.com/news-story/7101466-demand-for-french-immersion-in-guelph-far-exceeds-board-cap/>
- Halsall, N. D. (1994). Attrition/retention of students in French immersion with particular emphasis on secondary school. *Canadian Modern Language Review*, 50(2), 312-345.

- Lazaruk, W. (2007). Linguistic, academic, and cognitive benefits of French immersion. *Canadian Modern Language Review*, 63(5), 605-627.
- Learning Disabilities Association of Ontario (2018, February). *Learning Disabilities Statistics: Some recent Canadian sources for statistics on learning disabilities*. Retrieved from <http://www.ldao.ca/introduction-to-ldsadhd/articles/about-lds/learning-disabilities-statistics/>
- Lyon, G. R., Fletcher, J. M., Shaywitz, S. E., Shaywitz, B. A., Torgeson, J. K., Wood, F. B., *et al.* (2001). Rethinking learning disabilities. In C. E. Finn, Jr., A. J. Rotherham, & C. R. Hokanson, Jr. (Eds.). *Rethinking special education for a new century* (pp. 259-287). Washington, DC: Thomas B. Fordham Foundation & The Progressive Policy Institute.
- Mady, C., & Arnett, K. (2009). Inclusion in French immersion in Canada: One parent's perspective. *Exceptionality Education International*, 19(2), 37-49.
- Mady, C., & Black, G. (2012). Access to French as a second official language programs in English dominant Canada. *Alberta Journal of Educational Research*, 57(4), 498-501.
- Ontario Ministry of Education (2017). Education Facts, 2016-2017 (Preliminary). Retrieved from: <http://www.edu.gov.on.ca/eng/educationFacts.html#note1>
- Ontario Ministry of Education. (2013). *The Ontario curriculum: French as a second language*. Retrieved from: <http://www.edu.gov.on.ca/eng/curriculum/elementary/fsl18curr.pdf>
- Ontario Public School Boards' Association (2018). *Meeting Labour Markets Needs for French as a Second Language Instruction in Ontario: Understanding Perspectives Regarding the French as a Second language Teacher Labour Market Issue*, Retrieved from http://www.opsba.org/SiteCollectionDocuments/FSLsummary_INTERACTIVE.pdf
- Paradis, M. (2004). *A neurolinguistic theory of bilingualism*. Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing Company.
- Statistics Canada (2017a). *Canadian Survey on Disability, 2017 in The Daily*. Retrieved from <https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/en/daily-quotidien/181128/dq181128a-eng.pdf?st=BWYUD8-e>

- Statistics Canada (2017b). *Table 477-0027 - Enrolments in French immersion programs, public elementary and secondary schools, Canada*, CANSIM (database). Retrieved from <https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/daily-quotidien/171103/cg-c001-eng.htm>
- Swain, M. (1974). French Immersion Programs Across Canada: Research Findings. *Canadian Modern Language Review*, 31(2), 117-129.
- Turnbull, M., Lapkin, S., & Hart, D. (2001). Grade 3 immersion students' performance in literacy and mathematics: Province-wide results from Ontario (1998-99). *Canadian Modern Language Review*, 58(1), 9-26.
- Wise, N. (2012). Access to special education for exceptional students in French immersion programs: An equity issue. *Canadian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 14(1), 177-193.

Finding the Right balance: Integrating Old and New Approaches for Anatomy Teaching

Rana Elbeshbeishy
University of Ottawa

Although anatomy is one of the core knowledge pillars within medical teaching, the level of knowledge covered in the modernized medical curricula in recent years around the world has declined considerably, due to the use of old-fashioned pedagogical methods. This study examines available approaches to anatomy teaching and how to improve student learning in this area, while also targeting higher skills and knowledge for future medical personnel. Using a mix of qualitative and quantitative methodologies to collect data, mini-interviews and online surveys were conducted with a sample of four participants (a student, a resident, and two medical educators) to explore the different aspects of anatomy learning and its key challenges. From this small sample of medical students and educators, data was collected around four key themes: fundamental introductory learning, technology-based education, teaching techniques, and updated curriculum. A thematic analysis of the participants' insights revealed that, while technology-based alternatives were considered effective tools, dissecting cadavers was the preferred means of learning anatomy.

Keywords: *anatomy, teaching techniques, learning, innovative approaches, technology-based education, computer, curriculum update, problem-based learning, online games*

Bien que l'anatomie soit l'un des piliers de l'enseignement de la médecine, le niveau de connaissances couvert par les programmes actuels de médecine dans le monde a considérablement diminué en raison de l'utilisation de méthodes pédagogiques désuètes. Cette étude examine les approches disponibles pour l'enseignement de l'anatomie et la manière d'améliorer l'apprentissage des étudiants dans ce domaine, tout en visant des compétences et des connaissances plus poussées pour le futur personnel médical. À l'aide d'une combinaison de méthodes qualitatives et quantitatives pour récolter des données, des mini-interviews et des enquêtes en ligne ont été conduits sur un échantillon de quatre participants (un étudiant, un résident et deux enseignants en médecine) afin d'explorer les différents aspects de l'apprentissage de l'anatomie et ses principaux défis. . À partir de ce petit échantillon d'étudiants en médecine et d'éducateurs, les données ont été rassemblées en quatre thèmes principaux : les apprentissages fondamentaux, l'enseignement fondé sur la technologie, les techniques d'enseignement et les programmes actuels. Une analyse thématique des idées des participants a révélé que, même si les alternatives technologiques

étaient considérées comme des outils efficaces d'enseignement, la dissection de cadavres était le moyen privilégié d'apprentissage de l'anatomie.

Mots-clés : *anatomie, méthode d'enseignement, approches innovantes d'apprentissage, technologie de l'éducation, ordinateur, mise à jour curriculaire, apprentissage par problème, jeux en ligne*

Based on my personal experience of teaching anatomy for 25 years to both undergraduate students and post-graduates in health-related professions (e.g., medical students and residents), it was clear that anatomy-teaching needed to be better integrated within the evolution of the modernized medical curriculum around the world (Bhangu, Boutefnouchet, Yong, Abrahams, & Joplin, 2010). The progressive development in medical knowledge over the last three decades, the continuous update of curricula to be clinically relevant (Johnson, Charchanti, & Troupis, 2012), as well as various technological advancements (Peterson & Mlynarczyk, 2016), have required that medical educators adapt to rapid changes. Given the misconception that anatomy is too detailed and lacks clinical relevance, anatomy curricula and teaching methods have gone through many changes to ensure that students have the skills and knowledge required for their medical careers (Bhangu et al., 2010; Johnson et al., 2012).

Although anatomy is mandatory for all medical specialties, the teaching of anatomy has struggled to cope with this progression. Indeed, anatomy still tends to be taught using conventional pedagogic methods, such as didactic lectures, textbooks and two-dimensional (2D) pictures. These traditional methods are typically paired with cadaveric dissection laboratories, which require maintenance as well as prolonged, intensive student work. For a variety of reasons, this approach came to be seen as old-fashioned and no longer appropriate (Johnson et al., 2012). For example, the increased cost of maintaining the dissection room, with a simultaneously diminishing number of cadavers, presented additional challenges (Johnson et al., 2012). Further, the decreasing number of anatomy staff who are qualified for teaching became a more prominent issue as well (Patel & Moxham, 2006). While I consider anatomy to be a vast and exciting branch of medicine, these reasons, as well as others explored in this paper, favor the decline of anatomy in the medical curriculum, subsequently crippling students' educational experience. Thus, over the past few decades, teaching hours dedicated to anatomy have generally been reduced, human dissection diminished, and the level of anatomical knowledge expected decreased

in the modernized medical curriculum, as the whole body was studied in only three or four semesters (Johnson et al., 2012). Consequently, there has been a recurrent need to devise a different clinically oriented and integrated anatomy curriculum that focuses on clinically related topics to be taught efficiently (Patel & Moxham, 2006).

Being a graduate of the Faculty of Medicine, at Ain Shams University in Egypt, which is one of the largest schools of medicine that follows a traditional system of teaching, most of my education in the twentieth century was based on professors' lectures, studying detailed textbooks and dissecting cadavers to gain practical experience. In my experience, there was not enough diversity in the teaching tools employed. Thus, students struggled to memorize detailed information, were unmotivated, and gained only a minimal understanding of the practical relevance of anatomy (Patel & Moxham, 2006). This experience was not confined only to anatomy; this was characteristic of the overall educational system where some professors might simply read their slides and students had little opportunity for interactive learning (Johnson et al., 2012).

Through my work experience, as well as through medical education literature, I found that the struggle to engage students in anatomy learning was becoming increasingly difficult, resulting in basic core knowledge gaps among students (Johnson et al., 2012; Patel & Moxham, 2006; Turney, 2007). Students in the same cohort were not learning at the same pace. Although many students were eager to learn, the amount of information, the use of traditional teaching techniques, and standardized evaluations based mostly on memorization, were major obstacles. Although much of my own learning was deeply influenced by old-fashioned pedagogical techniques, I challenged myself to motivate and engage students in a transformative introspective learning process, also known as perspective learning, which includes psychological, behavioural and convictional aspects (Kaufman, & Mann, 2010). For instance, to alleviate the anxiety of summative assessments, I provided frequent formative assessments, along with opportunities for my students to connect the theoretical portions of the curriculum to more practical elements. Not only did it seem clear to me that they enjoyed this approach, but I also observed an increase in the quality of the students' learning outcomes from formal assessments.

The aim of the present work is to explore different methods of teaching and learning anatomy, in order to identify preferred means of learning anatomy. I also investigate through this study whether alternative technology-based tools are appropriate to replace (or could at least be complimentary) to cadaveric dissection. In order to address my research objectives, I first conduct a literature review to provide an overview of recent anatomy

teaching and learning advancements in medical schools. I then report the results of a study using both interview and survey methods to examine the learning preferences of members in the Faculty of Medicine at the University of Ottawa. Finally, I discuss the implications of the present study's findings in light of my own professional experience in medical education.

Literature Review

Medical schools around the world have faced a steady decline in students' interest in anatomy (Bhangu et al., 2010). The authors conducted a three-year cohort study using a questionnaire answered by medical students to highlight this decline in student interest. Although the study's response rate had massively decreased after three years, the vast majority of participants agreed that clinical anatomy (i.e., the practical application of anatomical knowledge to clinical problem solving) helped them significantly with their clinical practice and placements. However, it also demonstrated that students felt a lack of knowledge in anatomy and would prefer more participation in surgeries. This study was important because it raised awareness on students' opinion around the suggested decrease of anatomy teaching hours.

Conversely, Patel and Moxham (2006) conducted a study to compare the attitudes of anatomists towards the medical curricular change within Continental Europe, including the introduction of new modern techniques and decreased students' exposure to cadaveric dissection for anatomy learning. Modernists were in support of curricular changes, while traditionalists refuted the hypothesis that cadaveric dissection and macroscopic anatomy were not crucial or preferred anymore. Over 100 anatomists responded to a matrix questionnaire, which entailed those qualified professionals to associate course objectives to appropriate teaching methods, to determine their preferred teaching method; the results were very surprising. Cadaveric dissection and prosection were significantly preferred, with 98% of professionals arguing the importance of gross anatomy (i.e., topographical, regional or systemic anatomy) in clinical medicine (Patel & Moxham, 2006). This study was important as it analyzed anatomy professionals' point of view, unlike others discussing students' and curricular committee's opinion.

Due to various challenges facing both anatomy educators and students, such as extensive time-consuming cadaveric preparation and limited resources, it is crucial to find the most effective and efficient alternative method for practical laboratory for human anatomy. To investigate this issue, Carlyle (2005) explored the effectiveness of three different learning techniques or methods: computer learning, combined computer/cadaver

learning, and cadaver learning methods. Based on a survey, Carlyle (2005) found no significant difference between the three techniques, however, the students preferred the cadaver. This work enlightened the reader on different anatomy teaching cultures and advantages; however, additional research is also important to compare the cost of acquiring a sufficient number of computers to replace cadavers.

Peterson and Mlynarczyk (2016) performed a study to identify the most beneficial type of teaching method: using traditional learning tools (e.g., lectures and cadaveric dissection), or using a combination of dissection with three-dimensional (3D) digital teaching technologies. From this experiment, the researchers found that assessments of the material utilizing the 3D augmented tools were better. There was a significant increase in correct answers for questions covering topics taught using the augmented modality. Critically, however, this perception of enhancement to their medical education was not recognized by those students who ranked the traditional learning tools as superior to the augmented one. Nonetheless, Peterson and Mlynarczyk's (2016) research still showed that 3D augmented tools helped knowledge retention, which meant it increased their medical abilities. Given the promising benefits, but mixed student preferences, this study pointed out digital technology was supplementary to traditional learning rather than a replacement. Some limitations to this study included the variability in choosing students, which ranged from undergraduate to doctoral student, as well as a lack of information about students' spatial abilities, which impeded a full assessment of the benefits of 3D modalities.

Johnson et al. (2012) argued that the progressive increase in expectations regarding the level of students' medical knowledge, together with decreased teaching hours, challenged medical educators to revise and modernize the anatomy curriculum. Researchers have tried to modify anatomical teaching in undergraduate medical education by promoting active learning, introducing clinical correlation, radiologic anatomy lectures, problem-based and team-based learning and providing time to work through clinical problems (Johnson et al., 2012). According to Johnson et al. (2012), today's technological teaching tools are very beneficial, but instructors still have a role to play in all laboratories. Traditional methods, such as lectures, were not omitted, but were taught by clinical faculty members and used as a base for all new teaching methods that were implemented to give a multi-dimensional approach to anatomy classes. Students' scores and performance progressively improved with the development of new skills, such as team collaboration, professionalism and leadership (Johnson et al., 2012). This study discussed the efficiency of implementing modern techniques into lectures and dissection in a multimodal curriculum.

An innovative active way to approach anatomical education was presented by Hoffman, Murray, Curlee, and Fritchle (2001), which implemented virtual reality-based anatomy resources. This program, created at the university of California, San Diego was called anatomic VisualizeR, and provided virtual dissection through 3D models, that allowed students to interact directly with anatomical structures. It was a learner-centered program that encouraged creativity and discovery through active learning. The 3D models were constructed by various sources and modified to enhance the user's experience (Hoffman et al., 2001). Introducing such alternative techniques in the dissecting room would result in decreased number of cadavers, alleviate negative emotional reactions by students, and reduce the off-putting smell.

Terrell (2006) illustrated that anatomy instruction had evolved from lecturing to student-centered learning as Universities' missions tended to make students less dependent on their instructors, thus enhance students' information processing. Terrell's (2006) study identified four major learning theories that education at the time revolved around: behavioural theories, information-processing theories, meta-cognitive theory, and social-constructivist theory. The behavioural and information-processing theories were aimed at learner's acquiring facts, skills and concepts with the help of the instructor. The former theory's learning strategies were superficial, consisting of memorization and practice, whereas in the latter theory depended more on the learner's prior knowledge activation combined with content-organizing strategies. The goal of the meta-cognitive theory was to enhance students' content and cognitive knowledge. Its learning strategies included planning, reflecting, self-testing and goal setting. The social-constructivist theory aimed to engage students' in deeper learning, as learners built new knowledge in a social context facilitated by the instructor (Terrell, 2006). This study signified a marked shift in medical education strategies, many of such changes I witnesses first-hand throughout the span of my teaching experience.

Following these earlier pedagogical shifts, Thomas, Kern, Hughes and Chen (2015) more recently presented six steps which can be used to improve curriculum development in medical education. Step 1 identified the need for curricular update due to the development of knowledge in medical and technological fields. In Step 2, the developers adapted curriculum to be more learner-centered and in Step 3, they set out new curricular objectives. Step 4 indicated that after the determination of the curriculum content, multiple educational methods (e.g., lectures, discussion, team-based learning etc.) must come into place, depending on the specific objectives desired. With today's technology, education has changed and so has the curriculum in medical education, leaning towards

learner-centeredness and creativity. In Step 5, developers (Thomas et al., 2015) tried to implement these strategies within medical education. Finally, in Step 6, they evaluated the balance between the needs of the learners and the methodological rigor. Thomas and colleagues' (2015) book sheds light on educational strategies and their influence on curriculum development. It would be crucial to know if implementing technology results in accomplishing educational objectives.

Recently, Bridges, Green, Botelho and Tsang (2015) introduced new educational methodologies to problem-based learning (PBL). PBL is about engaging small groups of students in exploring clinical cases, whether theoretical or real, to solve inquiries in a process of active, collaborative learning. These new techniques, such as utilizing interactive white boards, as well as online and digital resources, reinforced students' individual and collective knowledge. Not only could students share documents and tools, and had the ability to manipulate digital objects, but these new techniques also supported learning through inquiry within a realistic problem cycle (Bridges et al., 2015). This study had a significant impact on the medical education field's understanding of PBL, as it discussed the role of new techniques and technologies to increase cognitive systematized knowledge and took evidence-based approach to the medical curriculum through interactive discussions.

Nilsen (2015) claimed that the human body was the most complex structure ever studied. At the time of Nilsen's study, while multiple teaching techniques were used (including text books, lectures and human dissections), most of these techniques had proven to be ineffective as they failed to engage students. Thus, Nilsen's (2015) dissertation illustrated how games engaged students and how they complemented the traditional anatomy teaching techniques. Games offered students the ability to practice any time and as many times as they wanted. The premise of this dissertation suggests an educational framework where configurable games and learning activities can be used to complement students' other means to learn anatomy. Nilsen (2015) developed a system aimed to cover most anatomy curriculum, which made it a reliable anatomy encyclopedia that teachers could rely on.

It is clear from the present literature review that finding methods to engage students in anatomy is challenging and that many researchers have sought to examine the most effective ways to engage students. Many of these methods include student collaboration and the use of technology, which of course require new teaching approaches for instructors.

Study Framework

In the following sections, I employ different study techniques in order to identify the current and most preferred methods for anatomy teaching and learning. Drawing from the literature review and my teaching experience, several questions initially emerged, including: Is it more effective for anatomy learning to be spread throughout the years of medical education, or to condense it in the first few semesters? Can student preferences around frequency and type assessments (formative or summative) impact the achievement of learning outcomes? What is the relative cost of implementing more technology-based educational aids, such as a sufficient number of computers to replace cadavers? Should we consider shifting to computer-based learning due to a modernist question of ethics regarding dissecting cadavers? How might computer-based programs (e.g., online games and courses) help students to master anatomical structures or help students with different levels of spatial abilities? How best can teaching entities (e.g., universities) conduct continuous reviews and sufficiently update their anatomy curriculum?

Given the scope of the present study, not all questions could be answered and, thus, four main themes of questions were identified in order to focus the study and guide the analysis. These themes include: (1) introductory fundamental learning, (2) technology-based education, (3) teaching technique, and (4) curriculum update suggestions.

From an exploratory perspective, I identified the following questions to be addressed through this primarily qualitative study. For the introductory fundamental learning theme, I focused on: What is considered the best method(s) of studying anatomy? Which method(s) help students to understand anatomy concepts the most: 2D, 3D, dissecting real cadavers, or prosected cadavers? In terms of technology integration, it was important to identify from participants: Could computer programs replace anatomy lab instruction or enhance the learning experience enough to become the primary method of teaching? Regarding the teaching technique theme, questions were framed around student and teacher preferences, including: Is there a preference between teaching techniques, such as lectures or PBL or peer teaching; cadavers or models? Finally, in terms of pedagogical updates to match the continuous development of medical and technological knowledge, one main question was considered: What techniques are necessary to improve student engagement and the overall learning experience?

Methodology

Study Design

After exploring the different aspects of anatomy learning and the key challenges facing modern anatomy teaching, a mixed methods approach, was used to address the research questions. A rating-scale survey was conducted online to examine participant experiences and preferences regarding different anatomy teaching and learning methods. Along with the survey, brief (10-20 minute) interviews were conducted with current and recently graduated medical students. The findings from the interviews (a qualitative instrument) provided deeper understanding of the survey's (a quantitative instrument) findings (O'Leary, 2017).

Participants

Four individuals with different backgrounds and experiences in anatomy learning were chosen to participate in the current study, and each took part in both the survey and interviews. The sample included participants that are currently studying anatomy or have just finished their medical studies, as well as educators that teach anatomy using various tools. The purpose of selecting students and recent graduates as participants was to examine the challenges they have faced in their studies to grasp the knowledge and skills required for their career in the medical field. The purpose of asking teaching staff was to gain an understanding of the other party involved in anatomy education. The participants involved were all from the Faculty of Medicine at the University of Ottawa and included: a graduate-student who is currently learning anatomy in his first year at the Faculty of Medicine and who had taken undergraduate anatomy courses; a resident who had finished her anatomy courses; and two medical educators. Although the teaching staff had both studied anatomy using traditional techniques (e.g., lectures, atlases and cadaveric dissection), they currently work with more modern techniques, such as 3D technology, virtual reality simulations and other technological advancements.

Procedure

Online Survey. Twenty-nine survey questions were constructed and classified into the four sections aligning with the themes discussed earlier. The first section focused on participants' preferred means to learn anatomy (e.g., whether 2D, 3D, dissecting real cadavers or prosected ones), as well as their preferred study method(s) to understand anatomy concepts most effectively. The second section assessed technology integration and

whether computer programs could replace anatomy lab instruction. The third section of the survey focused on attitudes towards new teaching techniques, such as PBL, games, online courses and models, and participants' preferences in comparison to lectures and cadavers. The last section of the questionnaire focused on participants' suggestions to update the curriculum to match continuous developments in medical and technological knowledge. Participants were asked to choose the techniques necessary to improve student engagement and learning experience.

Quantitative survey items were rated on a 5-point Likert scale (1 = "*Strongly Disagree*" and 5 = "*Strongly Agree*") and were obtained from relevant literature, such as "I found the smell of the cadaver impaired my learning of anatomy." (Peterson & Mlynarczyk, 2016; Patel & Moxham, 2006). Other items, developed by me, were phrased in the form of short-answer questions, such as "Do you benefit when you teach? Does it help you understand and recall back the information better?", and "Yes" or "No" questions, such as "Do you enjoy working with computers?".

Phone Interviews. Following the online survey, I conducted ten- to twenty-minute phone interviews with each participant who completed the online survey in order to further explore their preferred anatomy learning methods. The interviews also delved further into the aspect of traditional teaching techniques versus technological alternatives. The interviews included such questions as: "Should we always look to modernize anatomy teaching techniques or are there fundamental methods, such as dissection, that are crucial to its understanding?" and "Would there be a day where professors' expertise is replaced by virtual reality program?".

Data Analysis

The data was analyzed primarily by looking for recurring themes in the interviews, based on the four thematic areas identified earlier: introductory fundamental learning, technology-based education, teaching techniques, and curricular update suggestions. The analytic process also included looking for similarities and differences in the responses between the interview and survey data and triangulating this information with previous research findings and my own teaching experience.

Results and Discussion

The interviews and online surveys conducted in the current research were enlightening as the findings provided new insights around anatomy teaching and learning from both medical students and educators. Through analyzing the data and making

connections with previous research findings and my own teaching experience, answers to the present study's research questions were found.

Introductory Fundamental Learning Theme

Regarding the introductory fundamental learning theme, three out of four participants felt that they had benefited from their anatomy courses and still retain some of the material they were taught. The graduate student mentioned remembering vague details from introductory anatomy courses which helped him in understanding material later on in medical school. These findings connect with those of Bhangu and colleagues (2010) who raised awareness on students' lack of knowledge in anatomy due to suggested decreases in anatomy teaching hours. Indeed, there was increased student enrollment in anatomy courses with the objective of increasing their confidence in surgeries, indicating the potential importance of prolonged anatomy learning to enhance future medical study and practice.

All participants in the present study agreed that their preferred method of studying and understanding anatomy was through dissecting cadavers. There are many well-documented benefits for using cadaveric dissection as a teaching and learning tool compared to other techniques. For instance, cadaveric dissection provides 3D views of the internal interrelationships of the human body (Carlyle, 2005). From my point of view, providing students with more opportunities for this kinesthetic type of learning provides crucial skills and tools that are directly applicable to future clinical practice. In addition, the psychomotor learning that occurs in physical dissection also helps in cognitive processing and development. Similarly, Peterson and Mlynarczyk (2016) highlighted the importance of accurate visualization and understanding the orientation of structures within the body to develop the spatial aptitude. The ignorance of anatomy has led to increased surgical liabilities and malpractice (Johnson et al., 2012). Thus, focusing on anatomy as a fundamental core of medical practice is essential. In the absence of cadavers, 3D models were favoured. This finding is in line with Peterson and Mlynarczyk's (2016) recent study which found that 3D augmented models significantly improved students' success on assessments, yet students tended not to recognize the enhancement to learning provided by the 3D models, as they also ranked the traditional learning tools superior to the augmented one.

Technology-based Education Theme

When addressing the technology-based education theme, all participants considered computer-based activities an effective medium to learn anatomy and complete assessments

such as quizzes. While this unanimous response is promising for technological educational enhancement, it may also be related to the fact that all participants also expressed their enjoyment of using computers and computer-based activities to assist in their learning. Although both educators and the graduate student agreed that online games would help in mastering anatomical structures of the human body, the resident could not comment as she had never used them. Even though two out of the four participants were not taught using online games and technology, they have now been exposed to this technology through their working experience and reported the value it brings to their teaching practice. These findings support Nilsen's (2015) conclusion that games have the capacity to uniquely engage students and to complement the traditional anatomy teaching techniques. For example, games offer students the ability to practice any time and as many times as they wanted (Nilsen, 2015).

In terms of preferences regarding cadavers versus technological alternatives, all participants agreed that cadavers were an effective medium for learning anatomy. They argued that it enabled them to touch the structures and to work in groups. Moreover, the notion that the cadaver is a difficult tool to learn from compared to computer-based options was rejected. Only the resident indicated that the smell of the cadaver impaired her learning ability. These responses are generally in line with the survey performed by Carlyle (2005), which explored three different learning methods (computer learning, combined computer/cadaver learning, and cadaver learning) where student respondents preferred the cadaver, although there was no significant difference in the students' learning outcomes between the three techniques. However, in another study by Peterson and Mlynarczyk (2016), it was found that adding digital technology teaching tools significantly improved students' understanding compared to cadaveric dissection. Although students' performance in their laboratory exams also improved, the same study still emphasized that digital tools were supplementary to traditional learning and not a replacement. As such, while there is still room for future investigation into sensory issues associated with cadaveric dissection, the present study's findings indicate that the use of cadavers remains a relevant and effective learning method, which are only enhanced by the use of technological supports.

Teaching Techniques Theme

In terms of teaching techniques, rote memorization of lectures alone was rejected as an approach to study anatomy by all study participants. Rather, memorization through understanding concepts was endorsed by all participants to retain information longer. This finding supports Terrell's (2006) assertion that such behavioural learning strategies are

superficial and should instead consist of a memorization process in which the learner acquires facts, skills and concepts with the help of the instructor. Further, to improve student engagement and overall learning experience, the graduate student suggested that teachers should spend more time on explanations using cadavers accompanied with 3D models to enhance understanding.

When lectures are compared with PBL teaching techniques, PBL was preferred by all participants as they felt that students are challenged to find the information for themselves. It is relevant to note that one of the educators emphasized the importance of combining both techniques, to create diverse learning experiences for the students. Although PBL has many benefits, such as, reinforcing students' individual knowledge by combining it with their group's knowledge, supporting inquiry learning within a problem cycle, and improving sharing documents and tools along with manipulating digital objects (Bridges et al., 2015), it does not cover all anatomy topics. As noted by one of the educator participants, lectures can still be turned to as an effective teaching technique to fill in this critical gap.

Through both interviews and surveys, participants expressed that teaching a concept to others (also known as peer teaching) greatly helped them retain new knowledge. Through my teaching experience, I always found peer teaching to be a very helpful pedagogic technique for better knowledge acquisition, comprehension and easier recall of information. At the beginning of my classes, I consistently encourage students to teach each other and share their knowledge. Through this practice, they benefit from their various experiences and I provide support by reinforcing the knowledge gained and clarifying the difficult concepts. In Thomas and colleagues' (2015) book *Curriculum Development for Medical Education: A Six-Step approach*, they illustrate that there are many advantages for peer teaching, which include the development of teaching skills in students as well as a safe environment for the new learners. In the same book, it was highlighted that there is also a need for creativity in medical education curriculum and in teaching methods. Despite the advantages of peer teaching, I find that a fixed teaching technique does not allow students to develop the best cognitive skills when analyzing all the different scenarios possible. Thanks to recent technological advancements, altered principles of education and the development of a new clinically-oriented medical curriculum, multiple pedagogical methods using a learner-centered approach are desired, which may include lectures, discussions, and team-based activities. I personally lead team-based activities, as well as lectures, and find that students benefit differently from each exercise. This emphasizes the need for a variety of teaching techniques.

Curricular Update Suggestion Theme

A major curricular update that both educators suggested was that anatomy should be taught throughout medical education, rather than the current method which condenses the study of the whole body into three or four semesters. Another suggestion proposed by the resident and graduate student was to implement review courses on regular basis. These findings reflect those of the three-year cohort study conducted by Bhangu et al. (2010), where they found that the vast majority of students felt a lack of knowledge in anatomy.

In terms of preferences regarding different kinds of learning assessment, a combination of summative type assessments and frequent quizzes were favored by all but one of the participants, as they tend to motivate students to study continuously and always be well prepared. While one participant mentioned that frequent quizzes can sometimes become stressful, all participants still recommended that students should be quizzed more frequently than at the current rate. Thus, implementing continuous review and assessment practices for explicitly formative purposes may be most appropriate. Further, all participants recommended increasing assessment questions that link clinical cases to anatomical structure identification. These insights, combined with those of Bhangu and colleagues' (2010), indicate that curricular updates may be most effective if they extend the anatomy curriculum across the medical degree program and integrate a focus on the practical application of anatomical knowledge to clinical problem solving.

Finally, the resident recommended increasing the use of PBL, computer programs and group quizzes to encourage a better grasp of the concepts. Similarly, one of the educators advised that using different software programs could enhance the visual and mental abilities of the students. Through these programs, the students can imagine the position of different structures and see their relations within the body. Thus, they would have a better understanding of the human body overall. The other educator emphasized that students should be aware of the importance of studying anatomy as a basic science as it would add to their clinical skills in the long run. These insights point to the importance of building medical curricula with specific teaching techniques and technological tools in mind, rather than leaving it up to individual educators to determine whether or when to employ certain tools that have been shown to be effective for anatomy learning.

Limitations

It is important to mention the potential limits to this study. Due to time constraints (as this study was part of a coursework project), it was only possible to select four participants for the survey and interview. First, this small sample size is a limitation because I could not make statistical inferences. Second, there was a limitation present in the methodology due to time constraints, which is that participants were hand-picked for the survey and phone interviews. Thus, the few participants did not allow for a fully representative sample. Despite the limitations of this sampling method, however, the study participants ranged from undergraduate and graduate students to academic teachers.

Conclusion

This paper's purpose was to investigate the current problems in anatomy teaching and to explore available approaches to improve anatomy learning by critically comparing traditional and new pedagogical strategies. Anatomy education needs new methods to adapt to the continuous progression of medical knowledge and technological advancements. Multiple research papers were used to preface this study as each identified a problem related to anatomy teaching, as well as suggested solutions mostly supported by empirical evidence. In light of the available literature, I conducted a study using both qualitative (interview) and quantitative (survey) methods.

Through this study, it was identified that the preferred means of learning anatomy (suggested by both students and educators), was through cadaveric dissections, despite all of the emergent computer-based games and 3D models available. These findings are in accordance with my previous teaching experience, where cadavers were the medium of preference for me as well as my students. Technology-based alternatives were effective tools to help enhance the learning experience but could not replace the core benefits of cadaveric dissection. A secondary finding was that problem-based learning (PBL) was greatly appreciated by students as it challenged them to find the answer for themselves and helped them retain knowledge more effectively. The PBL group setup also provided additional skills, such as teamwork, problem solving, self-directed learning and communication skills. However, PBL still does not cover all anatomy topics, which is where lectures are still considered an important information-based tool to fill in this gap.

Overall, a diversity of teaching techniques and technological methods are necessary to provide better anatomy learning experiences and outcomes for students. While this study

emphasizes how crucial the old techniques are to maintain, it also demonstrated how essential it is to use them in combination with new techniques for the ideal anatomical learning experience. Learning entities (e.g., medical education institutions) should therefore continue investigating the integration of the suggested methodologies in this paper, as well as new ones that will further contribute to making education an enjoyable, interactive and effective experience.

With a view to identifying more progressive ways of thinking and teaching that better represent the type of educator I aspire to be, the present study focused on the search for more effective teaching techniques and new motivational ideas. Critically, the overall findings revealed that we do need to find new advanced study methods (e.g., 3D programs, games and virtual reality to stimulate the intellect of students), yet we must use their capabilities thoughtfully and in *addition to* our tried-and-true traditional methods (e.g., cadaveric dissection and lectures). In this way, the present study also highlighted that we should try to focus on quality in our teaching rather than quantity, in order to enrich students' knowledge and promote a high-level of competency. This progressive way of thinking might reinvigorate students and engage them in active learning, which would help them succeed in their education and future clinical practice.

References

- Bhangu, A., Boutefnouchet, T., Yong, X., Abrahams, P., & Joplin, R. (2010). A three-year prospective longitudinal cohort study of medical students' attitudes toward anatomy teaching and their career aspirations. *Anatomical Sciences Education*, 3(4), 184-190.
- Bridges, S., Green, J., Botelho, M., & Tsang, P. C. S. (2015). Blended learning and PBL: An interactional ethnographic approach to understanding knowledge construction in situ. In A. Walker, H. Leary, C. Hmelo-Silver, & P. Ertmer, (Eds.), *Essential readings in problem-based learning: Exploring and extending the legacy of Howard S. Barrows*, (pp. 107-130). West Lafayette, IN: Purdue University Press.
- Carlyle, K. J. (2005). *A comparison of cadaver, computer and cadaver/computer laboratory classes in teaching anatomy to undergraduate university students*. (Master dissertation). Retrieved from Library and Archives Canada (ISBN: 0-494-03746-6)
- Hoffman, H., Murray, M., Curlee, R., & Fritchle, A. (2001). Anatomic visualizeR: Teaching and learning anatomy with virtual reality. In M. Akay and A. Marsh (Eds.), *Information technologies in Medicine: Medical simulation and education*, Volume I (pp. 205-218) New York, NY: John Wiley and Sons, Inc.
- Johnson, E. O., Charchanti, A. V., & Troupis, T. G. (2012). Modernization of an anatomy class: From conceptualization to implementation. A case for integrated multimodal-multidisciplinary teaching. *Anatomical Sciences Education*, 5(6), 354-366.
- Kaufman, D. M., & Mann, K. V. (2010). Teaching and learning in medical education: How theory can inform practice. In T. Swanwick (Ed.), *Understanding Medical Education: Evidence, Theory and Practice* (pp. 16-36). Dundee: Association for the Study of Medical Education.
- Nilsen, T. T. (2015). *Ontology-driven education: Teaching anatomy with intelligent 3D games on the Web* (Doctoral dissertation), Retrieved from https://digital.lib.washington.edu/researchworks/bitstream/handle/1773/33983/Nilsen_washington_0250E_14638.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y
- O'leary, Z. (2017). *The essential guide to doing your research project* (3rd ed.). London, UK: Sage Publications Ltd.

Patel, K. M., & Moxham, B. J. (2006). Attitudes of professional anatomists to curricular change. *Clinical Anatomy*, 19(2), 132-141.

Peterson, D. C., & Mlynarczyk, G. S. (2016). Analysis of traditional versus three-dimensional augmented curriculum on anatomical learning outcome measures. *Anatomical Sciences Education*, 9(6), 529-536.

Terrell, M. (2006). Anatomy of learning: Instructional design principles for the anatomical sciences. *The Anatomical Record*, 289(6), 252-260.

Thomas, P. A., Kern, D. E., Hughes, M. T., & Chen, B. Y. (2015). *Curriculum development for medical education: A six-step approach*. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press.

Turney, B. (2007). Anatomy in a modern medical curriculum. *Annals of The Royal College of Surgeons of England*, 89(2), 104-107.

Teaching Future Dietitians Leadership: A General Needs Assessment

Billie Jane Hermosura
University of Ottawa

The needs of the patient population are characterized by more chronic or complex health problems and the health care delivery system is constantly undergoing transformation. While discussions among stakeholders about changing the health system are essential, there is a concurrent need to focus on health professions education. There is a need to understand how entry-to-practice standards are used to develop health professions curricula. Based on recent stakeholder consultations and workforce assessments conducted by Dietitians of Canada and provincial interest groups, an emerging area of dietetic competency appears to be leadership. The purpose of this research project was to gain a better understanding around how competency standards are utilized to develop health professions curriculum, with a focus on dietetic curriculum related to management and leadership. To meet this objective, a general needs assessment was conducted using five databases: CINAHL, PubMed, FSTA, Scopus, and ERIC. The ancestry method was incorporated with purposive sampled articles to find additional research articles. The following key terms were included in the search: *health professions, dietetics, nutrition, management, leadership, education, curriculum, competency, entry-level*. A review of the literature indicates that developing professional competencies in leadership can strengthen some health professionals' capacity to take on certain roles through competency-based education. In addition, the long-term training effects result in an increase in specific competencies relevant for effective interprofessional collaboration. There is opportunity for pedagogical and practice-based activities to strengthen leadership abilities of future dietetic professionals.

Keywords: *leadership, dietetics, competency-based, health professions education, needs assessment*

Au sein d'un système de prestation de soins de santé en constante transformation, les besoins de la population de patients sont caractérisés par des problèmes de santé de plus en plus chroniques ou complexes. Bien que les discussions entre les parties prenantes sur la modification du système de santé soient essentielles, il est également nécessaire de réfléchir à la formation des professionnels de la santé. Il est nécessaire de comprendre la manière dont les normes d'accès à la profession sont utilisées pour élaborer les programmes d'études des professions de la santé. D'après les récentes consultations auprès des intervenants et les évaluations de la main-d'œuvre menées tant par les diététistes du Canada que par des

groupes d'intérêt à l'échelle provinciale, un domaine émergent de compétence en diététique semble être le leadership. Le but de ce projet de recherche était de mieux comprendre le processus par lequel les normes de compétences sont utilisées pour élaborer le programme de formation des professions de la santé, en mettant l'accent sur les programmes de diététique liés à la gestion et au leadership. Pour atteindre cet objectif, une évaluation générale des besoins a été réalisée à l'aide de cinq bases de données: CINAHL, PubMed, FSTA, Scopus et ERIC. La méthode d'ascendance a été utilisée de manière à procéder à une sélection plus approfondie d'articles de recherche supplémentaires. Les termes clés suivants ont été inclus dans les moteurs de recherche: *professions de la santé, diététique, nutrition, gestion, leadership, éducation, programme d'études, compétences, niveau débutant*. Notre revue de la littérature indique que la capacité de certains professionnels de la santé à assumer des rôles de leadership est renforcée par de la formation axée sur le développement de compétences professionnelles en leadership. En outre, les effets de la formation à long terme reliée au leadership se traduisent par une augmentation des compétences spécifiques utiles pour une collaboration interprofessionnelle efficace. Dès lors se révèle le potentiel des activités pédagogiques axées sur la pratique afin de permettre le développement des capacités de leadership chez les futurs professionnels de la diététique.

Mots-clés : *leadership, diététique, approche par compétence, éducation aux soins de santé, évaluation des besoins*

This paper argues that health professionals training must be reimaged and updated significantly to meet the needs of a changing patient population that has more chronic or complex health problems and to thrive in a health care delivery system that is characterized by ongoing transformation. Development of a coordinated, efficient, and effective multidisciplinary healthcare system requires a combination of evidence-based strategies and reliable workforce data to ensure that health professionals can work together in the interest of improved patient outcomes (Solomon, Graves, & Catherwood, 2015). However, substantive evidence about some health professions is sporadic at best, and thus insufficient to support the development of a multidisciplinary healthcare system (Solomon et al., 2015). Without coordinated policies there is a risk of health care workforce shortages that may produce unwanted public health consequences (Solomon et al., 2015). While conversations among stakeholders about changing the health system are essential to influence policy, there is a concurrent need to focus on the content and pedagogy of health professions education (HPE; Thibault, 2013).

A registered dietitian (RD) is part of the health workforce known as *allied health professions*. Allied health is typically used to describe the health workforce as distinct from physicians, nurses, pharmacists, and dentists, although the field lacks a single definition (Elwood, 2013). Dietetics is a regulated health profession in Canada, governed under the *Regulated Health Professions Act, 1991* and health professions *Acts*. RDs are health care professionals who are trained to provide advice and counselling about diet, food and nutrition. They use the best available evidence coupled with good judgment about the client's or communities' unique values and circumstances to determine guidance and recommendations¹. As the political and funding environment continues to stress the importance of evidence-based practices, key stakeholders are recognizing the need to facilitate collective engagement and set priorities for action with respect to HPE, including dietetics (Dietitians of Canada, 2016; Thibault, 2013). RDs must successfully meet academic requirements, complete supervised practice experience through accredited programs, and pass the provincial/national dietitian registration exam. To maintain the RD credential, dietitians must comply with the continuing competency program outlined by provincial regulatory agencies².

There is a need to understand how entry-to-practice standards, such as the Integrated Competencies of Dietetic Education and Practice (ICDEP) (Partnership for Dietetic Education and Practice [PDEP], 2013), are used to develop health professions curricula. In Canada, the ICDEP is the source of dietetic competencies which dietetic programs reference to develop their programs' curriculum. Currently, there are five dietetic competency areas (PDEP, 2013):

1. Professional Practice – Demonstrate professionalism.
2. Communication and Collaboration – Communicate effectively and practice collaboratively.
3. Nutrition Care – Provide services to meet the nutrition care needs of individuals.
4. Population and Public Health – Promote the nutrition health of groups, communities and populations.
5. Management – Manage programs, projects and services related to dietetics.

Based on recent stakeholder consultations and a workforce assessment conducted by Dietitians of Canada and provincial interest groups, there is anecdotal evidence that an emerging area of dietetic competencies is in *leadership*. The purpose of this paper is to

¹ Dietitians of Canada: <https://www.dietitians.ca/Become-a-Dietitian/What-Does-a-Dietitian-Do.aspx>

² For example, in Ontario, Canada: <https://www.collegeofdietitians.org/programs/quality-assurance.aspx>

identify and discuss a potential problem or learning gap in the education of health professionals, particularly around this emerging area of leadership. By utilizing the general needs assessment framework suggested by Thomas, Kern, Hughes, and Chen (2016), this inquiry will help the dietetic profession to develop a better understanding of how dietetic curricula currently meet the proposed new competencies. For example, Gregoire, Sames, Dowling, and Lafferty (2005) found that dietitians were not perceived by some senior healthcare executives to be highly competent in some of the leadership and operations management skills that were identified. This is a concern given that *management* is a competency area under the current ICDEP.

As a RD for over 12 years who has worked in various healthcare management roles, I find it surprising how few dietitians work in senior leadership roles outside of nutrition. For this paper, as the sole researcher and analyst, I present preliminary findings that help form the relationship between competency-based education (CBE), dietetics, and leadership development. In order to provide context for the general needs assessment, I first provide a brief background on what CBE is, as well as offer a working definition of *leadership*. To conduct the needs assessment, I review and discuss the literature related to dietetics education and leadership. Currently the ICDEP indicators related to leadership are embedded in other competency areas, such as Professional Practice, Communication and Collaboration, and Management. I conclude by recommending strategies to develop leadership abilities of future dietetic professionals.

Competency-Based Education in the Health Care Context

Within the context of health care, competence is integral to the delivery of safe, quality health care and other services that regulated health professionals provide (Academy of Nutrition and Dietetics [AND], 2013). Professional competence can evolve over time as health professions integrate new developments into clinical practice, expanding the body of knowledge and skills for each profession (Dower, Moore, & Langerlier, 2013; Takahashi, Nayer, & St. Armant, 2017). Competence to perform designated activities within defined practice settings is an essential element of health professionals' scopes of practice (AND, 2013; Bourgeault & Merritt, 2015). Some argue that attainment of specific competencies must be the defining feature of the education and evaluation of future health professionals within their respective disciplines of study as a strategy to ensure quality and standardization (Albanese, Mejicano, Mullan, Kokotailo, & Gruppen, 2008). Scope of practice designates the range of roles, functions, standards of practice, and regulations a profession's members are trained to perform (Bourgeault & Merritt, 2015; Dower et al., 2013). Scopes of

practice are multi-layered; competence to perform designated activities within defined practice settings is an essential element of a health professional's scope of practice (AND, 2013; Bourgeault & Merritt, 2015).

In order to effectively develop, maintain, and support the competence of health professionals, education planners must account for the many elements of competence. These elements include context and continuum of practice to recognize that practitioners begin with entry-level competence and gain further competence in other or advanced areas of practice throughout their careers (Takahashi et al., 2017). In HPE, one major step is identifying where to best integrate components of instruction and assessment related to specific competencies, and plan curriculum around the question "What abilities are needed of graduates?" (Frenk, Chen, Bhutta, Cohen, Crisp, et al., 2010; Mylopoulos, Brydges, Woods, Manzone, & Schwartz, 2015).

Central to CBE is the definition of *competence* (Fitzgerald, Burkhardt, Kasten, Mullan, Santen, et al., 2016). In dietetics, practice competency refers to a task that is performed in practice that can be carried out to a specified level of proficiency. The performance of a practice competency requires application of a combination of knowledge, skills, attitudes and judgments (PDEP, 2013). CBE has emerged as a foundational framework for defining the outcomes, methods, and organization of HPE, with the core tenets of the CBE paradigm requiring an understanding of competence as multi-dimensional, dynamic, contextual, and developmental (Fitzgerald et al., 2016). CBE focuses on learning outcomes rather than teaching process, on abilities in addition to knowledge, on skill-based versus time-based training, and the promotion of learner-centeredness (Fitzgerald et al., 2016; Takahashi et al., 2017). The competency-based approach is used to specify health problems and tailor the curriculum to address gaps between what healthcare professionals learn, know, and do versus expectations of patients, stakeholders, and regulatory agencies (Barton, Bruce, & Schreiber, 2018; Frank et al., 2010). One of the unique components of the competency-based approach is that success is based on the learner's ability to successfully incorporate knowledge, skills, and attitudes in the context of practice in specific domains, which emphasizes higher-level cognitive skills (Takahashi et al., 2017). While the concept of CBE is not altogether new, a better understanding of the facilitators and barriers to acquiring competence is warranted (Takahashi et al., 2017). In the next section, I will explore more deeply different definitions of leadership prevalent in health professions literature.

Exploring Different Definitions of Leadership

Several definitions and models of leadership currently exist within the contemporary literature. Traditional notions of leadership are conceptualized in relation to a hierarchy of an individual's positional authority and often focus on the leader's role in determining future desired states and directing organizational action to achieve those states. Katz and Kahn (1978) describe formal leadership as the incremental influence of position holders exercised via direct and indirect means to maintain or alter the existing dynamics in and of a system (see also Osborn, Hunt, & Jauch, 2002). The context of health care redesign is an inherently unpredictable environment (Denis, Langley, & Rouleau, 2010; Ford, 2009) and health systems cannot depend solely upon formally designated leaders. They must rely on a variety of individuals, networks, and groups who often do not have formal accountabilities and responsibilities to achieve system goals. As a result, health systems have become increasingly reliant on distributed leadership (Chreim, Williams, Janz, & Dastmalchian, 2010) or transformational leadership (Gabel, 2013).

Distributed leadership is considered to be a collective process where individuals negotiate their positions with respect to others in more unpredictable ways, rather than perceiving leadership as the result of single individuals (Denis et al., 2010). People with different skills and from different levels may pool their expertise and resources to foster change. This is particularly evident when interdisciplinary programs are implemented in health care organizations (Chreim et al., 2010).

The transformational leadership model might be one type of leadership with several characteristics that are potentially valuable for the health care environment and HPE. These characteristics include its principles- and values-driven approach, emphasis on relationships between leaders and subordinates, level of empirical support, intuitive appeal, and intention to *transform* and enhance the growth and work-related experiences, both of subordinates and leaders (Gabel, 2013). Education and training in health care, as in many fields, has hierarchical elements that are similar to the leader/follower, supervisor/supervisee relationships described that may benefit from the application of transformational leadership. The application of transformational leadership principles in HPE, however, should not be confined to these generally accepted hierarchical roles (Gabel, 2013). Leadership that is tied to formal hierarchical positions in traditional organizations is replaced by power sharing and collateral leadership, involving collaborative participation across boundaries. This may be achieved by diffusing leadership vertically and horizontally

across a network (Chreim et al., 2010). Additional training to gain competencies to shift and share tasks may help foster collaboration (Bourgeault & Merritt, 2015).

Health care relies on relationship-oriented professions; therefore/thus, successful health care professionals should be competent in establishing strong trust-based alliances with patients and colleagues. Transformational leadership requires leaders to encourage, support, and/or challenge those in lesser positions of authority to be innovative and active problem-solvers in order to find additional or better solutions to problems that arise. Educators in the health care fields would benefit from knowledge of leadership approaches that are empirically sound and appropriate for the health care environment (Gabel, 2013). In this way, educators can contribute to the socialization of future health professionals with respect to leadership competencies.

Theoretical Framework

This work is guided by Kern's "Six-Step Approach to Curriculum Development" (Thomas, Kern, Hughes, & Chen, 2016). This method was chosen for its comprehensiveness in allowing curriculum designers to plan a curriculum, whereby "curriculum" is defined in this context as a *planned educational experience*; it includes one or more sessions on a specific subject to a year-long course as well as clinical rotations to entire programs (Thomas et al., 2016). The six steps are:

1. Problem identification and general needs assessment;
2. Targeted needs assessment;
3. Goals and objectives;
4. Educational strategies;
5. Implementation;
6. Evaluation and feedback.

Step 1 of the "Six-Step Approach" is to conduct a general needs assessment, which requires a literature review and scan of existing resources (Thomas et al., 2016). The purpose of Step 1 is to build a rationale for the curriculum, ground the work in patient or societal needs, and focus on the curriculum's goals and objectives. It can also focus the educational and evaluation strategies as well as prevent duplication of effort. This study focused on Step 1 as a starting point to understand the literature on the relationship between competency-based education and leadership.

Methods

To identify the problem and conduct a general needs assessment, a literature review and scan of existing documents are conducted. One aspect of the needs assessment is to conduct a literature review. Five databases common in health sciences and nutrition research were used: Cumulative Index to Nursing and Allied Health Literature (CINAHL), PubMed, Food Science & Technology Abstracts (FSTA), Scopus, and Education Information Resource Centre (ERIC). The ancestry method, a search strategy to track down references cited by relevant sources, was also incorporated by reviewing the bibliographies for any useful citations found in the search along with purposive sampled articles to find additional research articles. Google Scholar was used to cross-reference citations and other articles. Articles were electronically searched by the author and selected from English-language peer-reviewed journals dated between 2010-2018. In health sciences research, it is common for articles to be written in English and the local language in which the project is relevant. Focusing on articles published in English, with the exception of a few websites in French, may be a limitation of this project and is a result of the author's language proficiency.

An abstract search used the following key words: *health professions, medical, dietetics, nutrition, management, leadership, education, curriculum, competency, entry-level, skills*. Key words helped to identify articles relevant to this topic and may be similar to key words used in previous studies. A simple search string was used across all databases in order to standardize the search method. Abstracts were then reviewed for specific relevance to the topic of dietetic leadership competency and the educational focus of this project. The University of Ottawa Education Liaison Librarian provided additional support to search databases for relevant articles. We concurred that the literature specific to dietetics is very limited and, consequently, the search was broadened to include the following additional key terms: *allied health professions, nursing and medicine*.

To gain an understanding of dietetic education in Canada, I reviewed 27 websites (see Appendix A): Dietitians of Canada (the national professional association; n=1), provincial dietetic regulatory colleges (n=10), and accredited dietetic university programs (n=16). I also reviewed a selection of course outlines on *management* and *professional practice* (n=10) from four dietetics programs to gain a sense of topic areas covered in these courses. While the course outlines were not current or a comprehensive representation of the dietetic curricula across Canada, the outlines provided insight into the learning objectives addressed in these types of courses and how these courses are taught within the past 10 years. Accreditation is the formal legitimization of an institution to grant degrees, enabling its

graduates to achieve licensing and certification for professional practice. The aim is to ensure an acceptable quality of graduates to meet the health needs of patients and populations. Lastly, I reviewed the Government of Canada section on Health Human Resources related to entry-to-practice credentials.

Findings and Discussion

The literature suggests that there is interest in improving leadership skills of health professionals, including dietitians, as early as possible as part of their academic education and training (AND, 2013; Frenk et al., 2010). However, there is limited evidence that competencies in leadership are well integrated into health professions curricula in general, let alone dietetic education (e.g., only three articles were found on this topic through my systematic search). This initial finding suggests that there is a difference between the current and ideal approaches to developing leadership skills in health professionals, indicating a potential learning gap and curriculum development opportunity. Thus, this section presents key findings of the general needs assessment and discusses their implications for HPE. First, competencies and curricula are discussed to draw a link between the health and education sectors. Second, the value health professions leadership will be discussed. The opportunity for leadership development through interprofessional education concludes the discussion.

Competencies and Curricula

From a high level, HPE is part of a complex system. There is a fundamental link between professional education and health conditions; balance between health and education sectors is crucial for efficiency, effectiveness, and equity. Population health needs and the labour market for health professionals are links between the education system and the health system (Frenk et al., 2010). Frenk and colleagues (2010) suggest that there is a crisis related to the emerging mismatch of professional competencies to patient and population priorities because of fragmentary, outdated, and static curricula, which produce ill-equipped graduates from under-financed institutions. Undergraduate education should set graduates up for lifelong learning (Frenk et al., 2010) by equipping them with valuable research skills, and competencies in policy, law, management and leadership. While this call for action is specific to medical education, it extends to nursing and allied health professions, including dietetics. Competence to perform designated activities within defined practice settings is an essential element of the scope of practice in nutrition and dietetics.

Recognizing and Valuing Health Professions Leadership

A focus on leadership training in medicine and nursing is well studied, however, there is limited literature on its application in other health professions. Generally, the literature suggests that health professions leadership is valued in the education and training of health professionals (Barton et al., 2018; Schmidt-Huber, Netzel, & Kiesewetter, 2017). For example, leadership competencies of physicians are important for successful interprofessional collaboration and patient care (Frank, Snell, & Sherbino, 2015; Schmidt-Huber et al., 2017). Leadership was also identified as key to competent nursing teamwork and as a catalyst for sustainability and effectiveness of team training programs (Barton et al., 2018), with mentorship seen as a key element of being able to lead others. Furthermore, there is growing discourse about the necessity and value of nurses and other health professionals enacting shared leadership roles in frontline health care teams. This shift toward collaborative leadership is emerging as important for improving interdisciplinary team functioning and patient care outcomes (Barton et al., 2018; Hickson et al., 2017).

Barton and colleagues (2018) also identified a need to understand other health professionals' capabilities and to share responsibilities on the frontline. There is a strong desire among health professionals for greater influence, as well as a recognition that we need to be more proactive, by leading rather than responding, particularly at the strategic level (Barton et al., 2018). With respect to dietetics, dietitians play a crucial role as part of interdisciplinary teams and may need to fill informal or distributed leadership roles, thus requiring greater influence to lead teams. Ultimately, dietitians wish to see widening career opportunities, a culture of strategic leadership, and greater influence and visibility, while at the same time retaining their strong foundations (Hickson, Child, & Collinson, 2017).

Current Dietetic Curricula and Leadership

Given that the three main articles (Arendt & Gregoire, 2005; Gregoire et al., 2005; Porter, 2005) found relating to dietetics and leadership are somewhat dated, there is minimal evidence of new research related to developing leadership skills in dietitians. This is not surprising in the Canadian context considering the reality that leadership is absent from the ICDEP competency areas and related performance indicators. As shown in Table 1, performance indicators from the five current competency areas that might address leadership skills are embedded in the areas of "Professional Practice", "Communication and Collaboration", and "Management".

Table 1. Current leadership-related ICDEP competencies

Competency #	Practice Competencies
Professional Practice	
1.11	Assess and enhance approaches to dietetic practice.
1.12	Contribute to advocacy efforts related to nutrition and health.
1.13	Participate in practice-based research.
Communication and Collaboration	
2.05	Contribute to the learning of others.
Management	
5.01	Assess strengths and needs of programs and services related to dietetics.
5.02	Manage programs and projects.

Downey, Parslow, and Smart (2011) suggest that most health professionals do not hold formal leadership positions and may or may not aspire to them. In addition, Porter (2005) writes that there are mid- and senior-level dietitians who are not willing or able to take leadership roles due to feelings of under-appreciation, inadequate compensation, and low job satisfaction. Unique competencies appear to be important for those aspiring to be in leadership positions. Dietitians were not perceived by senior executives to be highly competent in areas rated most important for leadership roles (Gregoire et al., 2005). Additional competency development may be needed to better prepare dietitians for leadership roles.

According to the literature, leadership can also be developed and demonstrated through mentoring of students, peers and colleagues (Barton et al., 2018; Kris-Etherton, Akabas, Bales, Bistrain, Braun, et al., 2014). Practicing RDs are often required to mentor students, interns and, in certain circumstances, other colleagues and health professionals.

However, there is no explicit evidence in the current ICDEP that mentorship is a required skill in dietetic practice. Upon review of the available Canadian universities' course outlines, it is evident that curricula are developed to meet the current ICDEP performance indicators, which do not explicitly call for leadership development. In a study conducted by Arendt & Gregoire (2005) on dietetic students in the United States, leadership behaviours were more prevalent in students who had previous leadership coursework, were older, or had previous leadership experiences. Thus, even with the limited literature available on this specific area, there is growing evidence that leadership should become an explicit core competency and a clear learning outcome in curricula in order to further promote leadership skills and ambition in dietetic students and dietitians.

Leadership Development through Interprofessional Education

Undergraduate education must prepare graduates for lifelong learning (Frenk et al., 2010; Mylopoulos et al., 2015; Takahashi et al., 2017). Traditionally, health professionals are trained and then continue their practice within silos, which not only limits opportunities for collaboration across health disciplines, but also increases competitiveness between professions (VanderWielen, Vanderbilt, Dumke, Do, & Isringhausen, 2014). To achieve a higher degree of effective team functioning, innovative approaches to interprofessional models of formal education, practical training, and professional practice are needed.

The World Health Organization (WHO, 2010) defines *interprofessional education* (IPE) as what happens when students from two or more professions learn about, from and with each other to enable effective collaboration and improve health outcomes. WHO (2010) recognizes IPE as a necessary component of every health professional's education. Bourgeault and Merritt (2015) also suggest that IPE may be a necessary intervention, but conclude that it is insufficient to make significant changes to scope of practice optimization, which occurs when health professionals can practice the procedures, actions, and processes that they are permitted to undertake in keeping with the terms of their professional license. IPE aims to deliver graduates with collaborative practice capabilities including communication, teamwork, role clarification, and client-centred care (Brewer, Flavell, & Jordon, 2017). IPE can also strengthen professional identity and increase value for health leadership. As a result, improved understanding and appreciation for different health professions' scopes of practice can be socialized through IPE and foster greater teamwork.

While dietetic education provides some baseline skills for health care and other management positions, to be successful and develop careers in this area, dietetic education

must reach beyond the dietetic community to develop skills in business thinking or health care administration (McClusky, 2005). Herein lies the opportunity for dietetic education. For example, there is evidence of leadership competencies being integrated into medical and nursing curricula (Barton et al., 2018; Schmidt-Huber et al., 2017). Through IPE, dietetic programs may be able to partner with other such health professions programs with established leadership development curricula. Schmidt-Huber et al. (2017) recommend implementing the development of leadership competencies as early as possible in HPE. Outcomes of developing leadership competencies earlier can strengthen awareness for leadership roles and the long-term training effects of leadership development result in an increase in specific competencies relevant for effective interprofessional collaboration.

Conclusion

Taken together, the findings of this general needs assessment suggest that health professions leadership is valued and seen as integral in interprofessional teamwork and patient care. However, for the dietetic profession, it is evident that in some practice settings, dietitians were not perceived to be highly competent in some leadership and operations management skills. Importantly, leadership behaviours *were* more prevalent in older students or those who had previous leadership training and experience. There is opportunity for pedagogical and practice-based activities to strengthen leadership abilities of future dietetic professionals. The needs assessment also suggests that medical and nursing education are beginning to enhance curricula with leadership training. Team-learning through interprofessional education between future dietitians and other health professions can support this type of leadership development and team socialization. Due to the ongoing transformation of health systems, strong teamwork, both within and between health professions, has become a necessity. This paper shed light on some of the major needs and learning gaps in health professions education, particularly for dietetics, with a view to building the capacity and confidence of dietitians to use leadership skills.

References

- Academy of Nutrition and Dietetics. (2013). Scope of practice in nutrition and dietetics. *Journal of the Academy of Nutrition and Dietetics*, 113(6), S11-S16.
- Albanese, M. A., Mejicano, G., Mullan, P., Kokotailo, P., & Gruppen, L. (2008). Defining characteristics of educational competencies. *Medical Education*, 42(1), 258-255.
- Arendt, S. W., & Gregoire, M. B. (2005). Dietetic students perceive themselves as leaders and report they demonstrate leadership in a variety of context. *Journal of the American Dietetic Association*, 105(8), 1289-1294.
- Barton, G., Bruce, A., & Schreiber, R. (2018). Teaching nurses teamwork: Integrative review of competency-based team training in nursing education. *Nurse Education in Practice*. 32, 129-137.
- Bourgeault, I. L., & Merritt, K. (2015). Deploying and managing health human resources. In E. Kuhlmann, R. H. Blank, I. L. Bourgeault, and C. Wendt (Eds.), *The Palgrave International Handbook of Healthcare Policy and Governance* (pp. 308-324). London, UK: Palgrave Macmillan UK.
- Brewer, M. L., Flavell, H. L., & Jordon, J. (2017). Interprofessional team-based placements: The importance of space, place, and facilitation. *Journal of Interprofessional Care*, 31(4), 429-437.
- Chreim, S., Williams, B., Janz, L., & Dastmalchian, A. (2010). Change agency in a primary health care context: The case of distributed leadership. *Health Care Management Review*, 35(2), 187-199.
- Denis, J., Langley, A., & Rouleau, L. (2010). The practice of leadership in the messy world of organizations. *Leadership*, 6(1), 67-88.
- Dietitians of Canada. (2016). *The dietetic workforce in British Columbia*. Retrieved from <https://www.dietitians.ca/Downloads/Public/2016-BC-Dietetic-Workforce-Survey-Report.aspx>
- Dower, C., Moore, J., & Langerlier, M. (2013). Is it time to restructure health professions scope-of-practice regulations to remove barriers to care. *Health Affairs*, 32(11), 1971-1976.

- Drath, W., McCauley, C. D., Palus, J., Van Velsor, E., O'Connor, P. M. G., & McGuire, J. G., (2008). Direction, alignment and commitment: Toward a more integrative ontology of leadership, *Leadership Quarterly*, 19(5), 635-653.
- Elwood, T. W. (2013). Patchwork of scope-of-practice regulations prevent allied health professionals from fully participating in patient care. *Health Affairs*, 32(11), 1985-1989.
- Fitzgerald, J. T., Burkhardt, J. C., Kasten, S. J., Mullan, P. B., Santen, A., Sheets, K. J., ... Gruppen, L. D. (2016). Assessment challenges in competency-based education: A case study in health profession education. *Medical Teacher*, 36(5), 482-290.
- Ford, R. (2009). Complex leadership competency in health care: Towards framing a theory of practice. *Health Services Management Research*, 22, 101-114.
- Frank, J. R., Snell, L., & Sherbino, J. (Eds.) (2015). *CanMEDS 2015 physician competency framework*. Ottawa: Royal College of Physicians and Surgeons of Canada. Retrieved from <http://www.royalcollege.ca/rcsite/documents/canmeds/canmeds-full-framework-e.pdf>
- Frenk, J., Chen, L., Bhutta, Z., Cohen, J., Crisp, N., Evans, T., ... Zurayk, H. (2010). Health professionals for a new century: Transforming education to strengthen health systems in an interdependent world. *The Lancet*, 376, 1923-1958.
- Gabel, S. (2013). Transformational leadership and healthcare. *The Journal of the International Association of Medical Science Educators*, 23(1), 55-60.
- Gregoire, M. B., Sames, K., Dowling, R. A., & Lafferty, L. J. (2005). Are registered dietitians adequately prepared to be hospital foodservice directors? *Journal of the American Dietetic Association*, 105(8), 1215-1221.
- Hickson, M., Child, J., & Collinson, A. (2017). Future dietitian 2025: Informing the development of a workforce strategy for dietetics. *Journal of Human Nutrition and Dietetics*, 31(1), 23-32.
- Katz, D., & Kahn, R. (1978). *The social psychology of organizations*. New York, NY: Wiley.
- Kris-Etherton, P. M., Akabas, S. R., Bales, C. W., Bistrain, B., Braun, L., Edwards, M. S., ... Van Horn, L. (2014). The need to advance nutrition education in the training of health care

- professionals and recommended research to evaluate implementation and effectiveness. *American Journal of Clinical Nutrition*, (suppl.), 1153S-1166S.
- McClusky, K. W. (2005). Adequate preparation vs thought processes – It's not the preparation, it's the strategy. *Journal of the American Dietetic Association*, 105(8), 1221-1222.
- McMurtry, A., Kilgour, K. N., & Rhose, S. (2017). Health research, practice, and education. In R. Frodeman (Ed.), *The Oxford Handbook of Interdisciplinarity* (2nd ed.) (pp. 412-426), New York, NY: Oxford University Press.
- Mylopoulos, M., Brydges, R., Woods, N. N., Manzone, J., & Schwartz, D. L. (2015). Preparation for future learning: A missing competency in health professions education? *Medical Education*, 50, 115-123.
- Osborn, R. N., Hunt, J. G., & Jauch, L. R. (2002). Toward a contextual theory of leadership. *Leadership Quarterly*, 13(6), 797-837.
- Partnership for Dietetic Education and Practice, (2013). *Integrated Competencies of Dietetic Education and Practice*. Retrieved from <https://www.pdep.ca/tools/standards.aspx>
- Porter, C. (2005). Are we training leaders? Conversations with three leaders. *Journal of the American Dietetic Association*, 105(8), 1204-1205.
- Schmidt-Huber, M., Netzel, J., & Kiesewetter, J. (2017). On the road to becoming a responsible leader: A simulation-based training approach for final year medical students. *GMS Journal for Medical Education*, 34(3), 1-19.
- Solomon, D., Graves, N., & Catherwood, J. (2015). Allied health growth: What we do not measure we cannot manage. *Human Resources for Health*, 13(32), 1-6.
- Takahashi, S. G., Nayer, M., & St. Armant, L. M. M. (2017). Epidemiology of competence: A scoping review to understand the risks and supports to competence of four health professions. *BMJ Open*, 7(9), 1-12.
- Thibault, G. E. (2013). Reforming health professions education will require culture change and closer ties between classroom and practice. *Health Affairs*, 32(11), 1928-1932.

- Thomas, P. A., Kern, D. E., Hughes, M. T., & Chen, B. Y. (Eds.). (2016). *Curriculum Development for medical education* (3rd ed.). Baltimore, MA: Johns Hopkins University Press.
- Watson, M. E. (2011). Needs assessment. In M. Watson (Ed.), *Systems approach workbook for health education and program planning* (pp. 11-22), Burlington, MA: Jones & Bartlett Learning.
- VanderWielen, L. M., Vanderbilt, A. A., Dumke, E. K., Do, E. K., Isringhausen, K. T., Wright, M. S., ... Bradner, M. (2014). Improving public health through student-led interprofessional extracurricular education and collaboration: A conceptual framework. *Journal of Multidisciplinary Healthcare*, 7, 105-110.
- World Health Organization (2010). *Framework for action on interprofessional education and collaborative practice*. Geneva, Switzerland. Retrieved from http://whqlibdoc.who.int/hq/2010/WHO_HRH_HPN_10.3_eng.pdf

Appendix A: List of Websites Reviewed

To gain an understanding of dietetics in Canada, included is a list of websites from various agencies and institutions related to dietetic education and practice.

Agency / Institution	Website
Dietitians of Canada	www.dietitians.ca
College of Dietitians of British Columbia	http://collegeofdietitiansofbc.org/home/
College of Dietitians of Alberta	http://www.collegeofdietitians.ab.ca/
Saskatchewan Dietitians Association	https://www.saskdietitians.org/
College of Dietitians of Manitoba	http://manitobadietitians.ca/home.aspx
College of Dietitians of Ontario	https://www.collegeofdietitians.org/
Ordre professionnel des diététistes du Québec	https://opdq.org/
Dietitians Association of New Brunswick	http://www.adnb-nbad.com/
The Nova Scotia Dietetic Association	https://www.nsdassoc.ca/
PEI Dietitians Registration Board	http://www.peidietitians.ca/
Newfoundland and Labrador College of Dietitians	http://www.nlcd.ca/
University of British Columbia	http://www.landfood.ubc.ca/academics/undergraduate/fnh/dietetics/

University of Alberta	https://www.ualberta.ca/agriculture-life-environment-sciences/programs/undergraduate-programs/degree-programs/nutrition-food-science/dietetics-specialization
University of Saskatchewan	https://pharmacy-nutrition.usask.ca/
University of Manitoba	http://umanitoba.ca/faculties/afs/dept/fhns/programs/HNS/index.html
Brescia University College	http://brescia.uwo.ca/academics/undergraduate-programs/school-of-food-nutritional-sciences/foods-and-nutrition/
University of Guelph	https://www.uoguelph.ca/family/
Ryerson University	https://www.ryerson.ca/nutrition/
Université d'Ottawa / University of Ottawa	http://sante.uottawa.ca/nutrition/
McGill University	http://www.mcgill.ca/nutrition/programs/undergraduate/dietetics
Université de Montréal	https://nutrition.umontreal.ca/
Université Laval	https://www.fsaa.ulaval.ca/nutrition.html
Université de Moncton	http://www.umoncton.ca/umcm-fsssc-esanef/
Mount Saint Vincent University	http://www.msvu.ca/en/home/programsdepartments/professionalstudies/appliedhumannutrition/default.aspx
St. Francis Xavier University	https://sites.stfx.ca/human_nutrition/
Acadia University	https://nutrition.acadiau.ca/home.html
University of Prince Edward Island	http://www.upei.ca/science/applied-human-sciences

Connection Failure: Systemic Disadvantages Facing the LGBTQ+ Community in Therapy and how to Address them

Erin Roach
University of Ottawa

This paper examines the experiences of members of the LGBTQ+ community in accessing mental health care in Ottawa, Canada, both positive and negative, and what might be done to improve outcomes. The paper includes a literature review of empirical studies and theoretical works about conducting therapy with LGBTQ+ clients, as well as the results of a pilot study conducted by the researcher to examine in depth the experience of a small sample of LGBTQ+ clients in Ottawa (N=4). Through semi-structured interviews, the researcher found that three out of four participants had experienced some dissatisfaction with how their identity was addressed in therapy, and as a result their overall well-being had suffered. This implies that therapists could be doing more to connect with their LGBTQ+ clients, potentially through better educating themselves on the issues affecting the community, as recommended by the participants. Increasing therapist knowledge would likely improve mental health outcomes for LGBTQ+ clients.

Keywords: *LGBTQ+, LGBT, queer, counselling, psychology, therapy*

Cet article porte sur les expériences à la fois positives et négatives vécues par des membres de la communauté LGBTQ + en matière d'accès aux soins de santé mentale à Ottawa, Canada, ainsi que ce qui pourrait être fait pour améliorer ces expériences. L'article comprend une analyse documentaire d'études empiriques et d'ouvrages théoriques portant sur la thérapie avec des clients LGBTQ +, ainsi que les résultats d'une étude pilote menée par la chercheuse afin d'examiner en profondeur l'expérience d'un échantillon réduit de clients LGBTQ + à Ottawa (N=4). Grâce à des entretiens semi-structurés, la chercheuse a constaté que trois participants sur quatre étaient mécontents face au traitement réservé à leur identité durant la thérapie; leur bien-être général en a souffert. Cela signifie que les thérapeutes pourraient faire mieux en matière de communication avec leurs clients LGBTQ +, en s'informant davantage sur les problèmes qui touchent cette communauté, telle que le recommandent les participants. Cette connaissance accrue chez le thérapeute pourrait contribuer à de meilleurs résultats pour les clients LGBTQ + en matière de santé mentale.

Mots-clés : *LGBTQ +, LGBT, queer, counseling, psychologie, thérapie*

Therapy, like any kind of health care, is meant to help those who (can) access it. Unfortunately, most models of therapy were created within white, Western, heteropatriarchal societies and therefore have a history of struggling to address the needs of individuals who have been disadvantaged by systems of power, such as misogyny, racism, or homophobia (Cochran, Sullivan, & Mays, 2003).

This research focused on one minority group in particular, that of the Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender, and Queer (LGBTQ+) community. Same-sex attraction was classified as a mental disorder from the first edition of the Diagnostic and Statistics Manual, published in 1952, until the fourth edition (DSM-IV-TR, 2000). Furthermore, *gender dysphoria*, defined as a strong desire to be a gender other than the one assigned at birth, is still listed as a mental disorder in the DSM-5 (2013).

Research indicates that LGBTQ+ people seek therapy at a higher rate than heterosexual, cisgender³ people (Cochran et al., 2003). Despite this, many recent graduates from psychology programs in the United States report feeling unprepared to work with LGBTQ+ clients (Sherry, Whilde, & Patton, 2005). Furthermore, many LGBTQ+ clients report “considerable discrimination and hostility” from their therapists (Shelton & Delgado-Romero, 2011, p. 210).

The therapeutic relationship is impacted by any potential biases held by the therapist, whether intentional or not. North American society is heteronormative and cisnormative, meaning that people are expected to be heterosexual and to identify with the gender they were assigned at birth, and that those who fall outside of these norms often face discrimination and prejudice (Ginicola, Smith, & Filmore, 2017). Anyone within such a society can hold heteronormative and cisnormative bias, even unconsciously; therefore, even a therapist with the best of intentions can damage the therapeutic relationship due to underlying prejudice.

The objective of the present research was to explore to what extent the experiences of LGBTQ+ clients in psychotherapy are positive and/or negative, and what contributes to those experiences (e.g., therapist behaviour, techniques, therapeutic approaches). First, the researcher examined some of the recent empirical studies and theoretical papers on the topic, summarized below. Then, the researcher conducted a pilot study with members of the LGBTQ+ community who had attended therapy. The goal of the research was to deepen the

³ “Cisgender” is a term describing someone who identifies with the gender they were assigned at birth – i.e. the opposite of transgender (Ginicola, Smith, & Filmore, 2017).

understanding of where problems may exist for LGBTQ+ clients in order to use this information to better prepare therapists to work with members of the community, and therefore, improve mental health outcomes for them.

Literature Synthesis

An influential study for the formation of the present research, conducted by O'Shaughnessy and Spokane (2013), discussed the limitations of affirmative therapy. Affirmative therapy is the only LGBT-specific approach and refers more to the act of applying an appreciation of queer struggles to the therapy than a therapeutic model in itself. The in-training participants had to present their therapeutic conceptualizations (i.e., theory and plan) of a series of clinical vignettes involving queer clients (e.g., a gay man adjusting to a new job) which they were then rated on out of a score of 25. Then the participants rated their own competence on working with LGBTQ+ clients. Researchers found that there was a significant discrepancy between therapists' self-assessment scales and their scores on the clinical vignettes (participants had a mean score of 4 points out of a possible 25 on the vignettes, but had scored themselves above average on the assessment scales). This data indicates that many therapists-in-training may see themselves as more competent in working with LGBTQ+ clients than they really are. Clearly, there need to be other metrics by which to assess a therapeutic relationship beyond therapist self-assessment, for example, by talking to clients. This finding was partially reinforced by Johnson and Federman (2014), who found that recent psychology graduates feel competent when it comes to working with the LGBT population, but have not received any specific training or experience with that population. Furthermore, Bidell and Whitman (2013) assessed scales and inventories meant to explore competency with LGB clients, and, while they found the scales to be valid and reliable, they also suggested that educators should develop opportunities for students to work with LGB populations directly. Bidell (2017) also developed his own self-assessment scale that includes transgender populations, though it comes with all the same limitations as other therapist self-assessment scales discussed above.

The other study that was foundational to the present research was conducted by Shelton and Delgado-Romero (2011), which focused more on clients. This study emphasized microaggressions in psychotherapy, and how they deter LGBQ clients from seeking mental health care. Micro-aggressions are looks, gestures, tones, and word choices that communicate prejudice, often unintentionally, like a certain tone of voice when saying "gay", for example. The researchers looked at 16 people who identified as LGBQ in the United States who were split into two focus groups and asked questions about their experiences with

therapists. Seven themes emerged in the discussions: over-emphasis of sexual orientation, avoidance of sexual orientation, attempts to over-identify with the client, making stereotypical assumptions about the client, expression of heteronormative bias, assumption that queerness was inherently unhealthy, and warnings about dangers of identifying as LGBQ. The participants reported, as a result, feelings of discomfort and manipulation, a loss of faith in the profession, and a decreased likelihood of seeking therapy again. Spengler, Miller, and Spengler (2016) also looked at microaggressions towards sexual minority clients and suggested strategies for how to create a more affirmative therapeutic environment. For example, they suggested that therapists could do this through guarding against language errors and not making assumptions about identity.

O'Shaughnessy and Speir (2018) conducted a systematic review of 49 empirical studies on effective therapy with LGBQ clients. They found that there had been significant growth in the field in recent years, but that there is still a lack of clarity about what exactly constitutes affirmative therapy, as well as no established way to assess client outcomes. The researcher sampled available literature, both empirical studies and theoretical papers, to gain a fuller understanding into the topic of counselling LGBTQ+ clients. The first of these was conducted by Chui, McGann, Ziemer, Hoffman, and Stahl (2017) and explored the importance of supervisors in the counselling setting in the United States. They examined the role of supervision of recent psychotherapy graduates by more seasoned therapists in working with LGQ clients and other minorities. Chui and colleagues (2017) found that having a strong supervisor relationship improved the therapists' perceived relationships with all clients, including sexual minorities. This could indicate that having someone else to turn to for advice is beneficial in getting past any unconscious biases; however, the study did not survey clients to see if they also experienced an improvement in the relationship.

Alessi, Dillon, and Kim (2015; 2016) conducted two empirical studies on the topic of LGBTQ+ counselling. The first study (2015) found that more affirmative attitudes in the counsellor contribute to more affirmative practice. They suggested that students need to be given opportunities to counsel queer clients and that training programs should focus on improving attitudes towards the LGBTQ+ community. The second study (2016) expanded on the earlier research, suggesting that aspiring therapists should be encouraged to explore their own sexual identity development and how it may affect their work with LGBTQ+ clients. Ebersole, Dillon, and Eklund (2018) found that therapists have greater knowledge and skills about lesbian and gay clients than they do about bisexual clients, indicating that a general LGB competency may not exist.

Diamond and Shpigel (2014) explored whether or not attachment-based family therapy could help queer young adults reconnect with their parents. The researchers attempted to repair the attachment bond that had been broken by strife over the person's queer identity, while also promoting their autonomy and competence. This method was very successful in some cases, moderately successful in others, and failed in a few other cases, seemingly mediated by individual differences between participants.

Steelman (2016) used another approach, narrative therapy, which is believed to be particularly useful with minority clients because it considers cultural contributions to a problem, such as systemic inequality and discrimination. Steelman's case study used a narrative technique called externalization, which separates a person from their problem, to help a gay adolescent decouple the cultural meaning of "being gay" from the adolescent's own meaning of being gay, thereby giving him control over the label and his own story.

The other type of literature surveyed for the present study were theoretical papers, detailing potential avenues of interest for therapists working with LGBTQ+ clients. Addison and Coolhart (2015) emphasized the use of intersectionality to address the complex identities present in therapy. Intersectionality, which comes from feminist theory, is a way of considering the different axes of power and oppression, such as sexism, racism, or homophobia. These researchers also focused on minimizing the power difference between therapist and client.

Hicks's (2010) article discussed counselling people who belong to more than one marginalized group, known as a double minority. A therapist must be mindful of the ways in which each identity plays a role in the client's life. For example, a physically disabled gay man may experience homophobia in the same way an able-bodied gay man would, but he may also experience ableism from both society at large and from the queer community (e.g. a gay bar in a basement with no elevator).

The gathered literature also contained two collections of articles about counselling LGBTQ+ clients, one edited by Dworkin and Pope (2015) and one edited by Ginicola and colleagues (2017). Both have a multicultural, affirmative approach to the issue of how to counsel LGBTQ+ clients, meaning that, instead of suggesting specific techniques or theories, they are comprised of articles detailing how different groups within the community define themselves and information that might be useful to therapists who are working with clients who belong to those groups. These articles include information ranging from lifestyle concerns to cultural issues; for example, how bisexual people often face discrimination from

both mainstream society and gay men and lesbians, or the history of non-binary genders in some Indigenous cultures.

McDowell, Emerick, and Garcia (2014) identified that the field of family therapy has not made any attempt to address an increase in families with LGBTQ+ members. They suggest that models of family therapy are still bound up in heterosexist norms (e.g. marriage to a different-gender partner, having children), and that this is problematic when it comes to addressing LGBTQ+ clients whose lives may look much different. The researchers suggested that therapists should engage in a dialogue with both colleagues and clients that challenge the heteronormative constructs of family in order to better address the needs of all families and all clients.

Finally, Hodges (2011) wrote that psychoanalysis, while an older theory, can still be relevant, and is particularly useful when working with queer clients because it deals with understanding and resisting power. Instead of breaking down the power difference in the therapist-client relationship, which other approaches might try, psychoanalysis makes use of the therapist's power to authorize the client to embrace and normalize their own experiences.

Of the literature summarized above, some focus on approach or technique (e.g. psychoanalysis, narrative therapy, etc.). All approaches were found to be generally effective, implying that it is perhaps the therapeutic relationship itself that is helpful, rather than any specific technique. Many of the summarized studies indeed looked more at general aspects of therapy and the quality of the relationship, as well as the impact of the therapist's own sensitivity to differences.

The research made it clear that therapist self-assessment did not give the full picture of the quality of therapy, and that LGBTQ+ clients seem to frequently experience difficulty as a result of prejudice, regardless of whether it is conscious or not. Though client assessment is also potentially susceptible to bias, a client is in a better position to evaluate whether or not they think that therapy improved their wellbeing, particularly when they belong to a marginalized group and dynamics of power and oppression enter into the discussion. Therefore, the present research set out to better understand what clients are experiencing in therapy.

Theoretical Framework

In crafting this pilot study, the researcher drew two conclusions from the literature: 1) that the majority of research focused on the experiences of therapists, rather than on the clients; and 2) that many studies excluded certain queer identities without explicit justification (e.g., many excluded transgender participants, some excluded bisexual participants). These areas seemed to be gaps in the literature when it comes to the topic of therapy with LGBTQ+ clients. Therefore, this study was designed to centre the voices of LGBTQ+ clients to allow them to describe their own experiences in therapy.

The theoretical framework of this research was a combination of client-centered therapy and queer theory. Client-centered therapy, first pioneered by Carl Rogers, prioritizes the experiences of clients above the expertise of the therapist, whose primary role is to assist the client in gaining insight by listening empathically and non-judgmentally (Client-centered therapy, 2006). Queer theory is a school of thought meant to examine and challenge systems of power within society, including but not limited to heteronormativity and cisnormativity (Hodges, 2011). These approaches allowed the research to prioritize the clients' experience while also being critical of the systems of power that pervade both therapeutic relationships and society itself.

Methodology

To adhere to the client-centered approach, this was a qualitative study to allow participants to explain their own experiences. The researcher used a semi-structured interview to ensure that they addressed key topics, but to also allow for fluidity and spontaneity. This was a compromise between the researcher's agenda and the participants' agency.

All participants self-identified as members of the LGBTQ+ community. In order to be eligible, participants must have attended therapy where their gender and/or sexuality was discussed at some point. Participants were recruited through a public post on social media outreach for the Ottawa LGBTQ+ community asking for volunteers, and were compensated for their time with a non-alcoholic drink (e.g., a coffee). Six people responded, but two dropped out before they could be interviewed. All four remaining participants identified themselves as white, able-bodied, and educated; all four were between the ages of 18 and 25.

In accordance with the client-centered theoretical approach, the questions focused on drawing out the participants' own experiences. Participants were asked to identify what they found helpful or unhelpful in connecting with their therapist, and if they found any specific approaches to be helpful (e.g., narrative therapy, affirmative therapy). Finally, in an attempt to equalize the power discordance between therapist and client, particularly when minority identities are involved, participants were asked if they had any recommendations for therapists working with LGBTQ+ clients. Due to the semi-structured nature, every interview included spontaneous questions based on the responses of the participants.

Ethical Considerations

This research was conducted as part of the requirements for the class *EDU 5190 Introduction to Research in Education*, under the supervision of a university professor. Participants were presented with a consent form outlining the purpose of the study, the design of the questions, and the potential risks (e.g., potential emotional distress). The consent form was given to participants in advance, but also discussed in person to ensure understanding. After the interview, the participants were debriefed and invited to bring up any thoughts or feelings triggered by the discussion.

The interviews were conducted in the researcher's office with the door closed. Each interview took approximately one hour. Audio recordings of the interviews were stored on the researcher's computer under a locked file. Interviews were transcribed verbatim and then themes, similarities, and differences were identified. In accordance with the requirements of the class, and as described in the consent form, these recordings and any other identifying details about the participants were deleted at the conclusion of the class, in December 2017. There were no known breaches of privacy.

Results

The study was comprised of four individuals who self-identified as members of the LGBTQ+ community. Participant #1 was a cisgender, bisexual woman. Participant #2 was a cisgender, demisexual⁴ woman. Participant #3 was a transgender man who defined his sexuality as "queer". Participant #4 was a pansexual, nonbinary⁵ person (i.e., "they/them")

⁴ "Demisexual" is a term that describes someone who cannot feel sexual attraction to another person until forming an emotional bond; considered to be under the asexual umbrella (Ginicola, Filmore, & Smith, 2017).

⁵ "Nonbinary" is a term that describes someone whose gender is neither male nor female; usually spelled "non-binary" but this participant indicated they spell it as one word.

pronouns). Participants #1 and #4 described a mix of positive and negative experiences, both with therapy in general and discussing their identities. Participant #1 reported that her experiences had been mostly positive, but that her therapist over-focused on her identity and coming out. Participant #4 said that they were refused service by the first psychologist they contacted because the psychologist did not deal with “transgender issues”. However, they were seeking therapy for anxiety, not for anything to do with their gender. They were later referred to a psychologist who dealt specifically with transgender clients, and while they were satisfied with their new psychologist, they expressed distress at the initial refusal.

Participant #2 described having only negative experiences with therapy. She explained that while the relationship had always been problematic, attempting to discuss her sexuality had resulted in dismissal and rejection, which irrevocably damaged the relationship. Participant #3 reported almost exclusively positive experiences in therapy; he and his therapist had a great relationship, and she was extremely supportive of his realization that he was transgender. He believed their good rapport was due in part to the fact that his therapist was herself gay, meaning that she already understood LGBTQ+ issues.

Something that all three participants with some negative experiences raised was the desire for therapists to have more knowledge about queer identities and issues facing the LGBTQ+ community, and/or for them to at least be more accepting of the client’s experience of their identity. Participant #4 explained that it was “exhausting” to constantly justify their identity to society at large, and that a truly therapeutic space would be one where they did not have to do this. The participants expressed that they realized queer terminology is constantly evolving, but an effort to stay on top of community terms and issues would be appreciated, and to take clients at their word.

When questioned about approach and technique, two of the four participants did not know what form of psychotherapy they had received. The other two participants had received cognitive-behavioural therapy, though neither had insight into whether this approach had been especially helpful to them. None of the participants identified any techniques that had been either helpful or harmful to them.

Participants #1 and #3 said that acceptance from the therapist strengthened the therapeutic relationship and helped them feel connected to their therapist. Participant #4 felt connected to their second psychologist upon receiving affirmation, but the rejection from their first damaged their trust. The rejection that Participant #2 received damaged the relationship beyond repair and their trust in the profession.

Discussion

None of the participants felt their experience in therapy had been impacted by the therapeutic approach or techniques used. Therefore, no conclusions can be drawn from this study about whether or not any techniques are better suited to working with LGBTQ+ clients than others. Instead, the participants' experience of therapy was affected by their relationship with their therapist and how the therapist had responded to their identity.

Three out of four participants reported at least some level of dissatisfaction with the way in which their identity was handled by therapists, which is concerning. The only participant with exclusively positive experiences had a queer therapist, and while there are undoubtedly implications that could be drawn about the therapeutic power of being from the same marginalized group as one's client, this was not the focus of the present research. Non-queer therapists need to be able to connect with LGBTQ+ clients, and in this regard, the participants indicated disappointment.

As supported by much of the existing literature, the present study indicates that therapist competency with LGBTQ+ clients and issues could be improved (Cochran et al., 2003, O'Shaughnessy & Spokane, 2013; Shelton & Delgado-Romero, 2011). The three participants with mixed or negative experiences all experienced some form of microaggression, as described in research by Shelton and Delgado-Romero (2011) and Spengler et al. (2016). Participant #2 had her identity dismissed by her therapist, and Participants #1 and #4 had their identities overemphasized by their therapists. Participant #1's therapist overemphasized by pushing her to talk about it, while Participant #4's therapist refused to treat them and pathologized their identity. In all three cases, their own experiences were invalidated and their needs were not met.

All four participants expressed a desire for therapists to have a better understanding of LGBTQ+ terminology and issues. They explained that they would be more comfortable with therapists who showed more knowledge and would, thus, find it easier to form a more trusting relationship. O'Shaughnessy and Spokane (2013), as well as Johnson and Federman (2014), showed that graduates are unprepared to counsel LGBTQ+ clients, a problem that could be countered in training. Alessi and colleagues (2015; 2016) also support the need for more LGBTQ+ competency training in psychology and counselling programs. Resources such as Dworkin and Pope (2015) or Ginicola et al. (2017) and mandatory courses on multicultural counselling could be used to enhance therapist competency. A shift needs to be made in the overall institution of psychology towards understanding and catering to diverse

populations, and some of this could also come from supervisors once in the field, as shown in Chui et al.'s (2017) research.

The major limitation to the present research is that it was not sufficiently intersectional, and therefore missing additional complexity in therapeutic relationships. None of the participants were double minorities, who, as discussed in the research by Hicks (2010), face different struggles than those who have only a marginalized sexuality or gender. Intersectionality is an important part of working with LGBTQ+ clients (Addison & Coolhart, 2015), and, therefore, future research should seek to gather information from queer people of colour, disabled queer people, etc. Furthermore, there may have been selection bias in those who agreed to participate. For example, those who agreed to participate may have been more inclined to do so because they had negative experiences they wanted to share.

Conclusion

The objective of this study was to determine what kinds of experiences LGBTQ+ clients were having in therapy, and what was contributing to those experiences. Three out of four participants expressed some level of dissatisfaction, which is a concerning statistic. These participants experienced that theoretical approach and technique had less of an impact on their outcome than the relationship they had with their therapist, which was impacted by conscious or unconscious bias.

Because the dissatisfaction revolved around how their sexuality or gender was handled, the results imply that LGBTQ+ clients are at a disadvantage when it comes to accessing mental health services, which is backed up by previous research. These experiences may result in worse mental health outcomes and may drive LGBTQ+ people away from seeking help. Therefore, therapists must work even harder to prevent these disconnects from happening.

Though the present research is only a pilot study, and future more intersectional research should be conducted, the results indicate that therapists should trust in their clients' experiences and actively work to learn more about the LGBTQ+ community. Potentially, this problem could be addressed in their education and training, with more emphasis being placed on multicultural counselling and connecting with clients who are members of different minority groups than the therapist.

References

- Addison, S. M., & Coolhart, D. (2015). Expanding the therapy paradigm with queer couples: A relational intersectional lens. *Family Process, 54*(3), 435-453.
- Alessi, E. J., Dillon, F. R., & Kim, H. M. (2015). Determinants of lesbian and gay affirmative practice among heterosexual therapists. *Psychotherapy, 52*(3), 298-307.
- Alessi, E. J., Dillon, F. R., & Kim, H. M. (2016). Therapist correlates of attitudes toward sexual minority individuals, affirmative counselling self-efficacy, and beliefs about affirmative practice. *Psychotherapy Research, 26*(4), 446-458.
- Bidell, M. P. (2017). The lesbian, gay, bisexual, and transgender development of clinical skills scale (LGBT-DOCSS): Establishing a new interdisciplinary self-assessment for health providers. *Journal of Homosexuality, 64*(10), 1432-1460.
- Bidell, M., & Whitman, J. (2013). A review of lesbian, gay, and bisexual affirmative counselling assessments. *Counseling Outcome Research and Evaluation, 4*(2), 112-126.
- Chui, H., McGann, K. J., Ziemer, K. S., Hoffman, M.A., & Stahl, J. (2017). Trainees' use of supervision for therapy with sexual minority clients: A qualitative study. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*. Advance online publication, 1-15. Retrieved from http://resolver.scholarsportal.info/resolve/00220167/v65i0001/36_tuosftsmc_aqs
- Client-centered therapy. (2006). Cover story. *Harvard Mental Health Letter, 22*(7), 1-3.
- Cochran, S. D., Greer Sullivan, J., & Mays, V. M. (2003). Prevalence of mental disorders, psychological distress, and mental health services use among lesbian, gay, and bisexual adults in the united states. *Journal of Consulting and Clinical Psychology, 71*(1), 53-61.
- American Psychiatric Association. (2000). *Diagnostic and statistical manual of mental disorders*. (4th ed., Text Revision). Washington, DC: American Psychiatric Publishing.
- American Psychiatric Association. (2013). *Diagnostic and statistical manual of mental disorders*. (5th ed.). Arlington, VA: American Psychiatric Publishing.

- Diamond, G. M., & Shpigel, M. S. (2014). Attachment-based family therapy for lesbian and gay young adults and their persistently nonaccepting parents. *Professional Psychology: Research and Practice*, 45(4), 258-268.
- Dworkin, S. H. & Pope, M. (Eds.). (2015). *Casebook for counselling: Lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender persons and their families*. Alexandria, VA: American Counseling Association.
- Ebersole, R. C., Dillon, F. R., & Eklund, A. C. (2018). Mental Health Clinicians' Perceived Competence for Affirmative Practice with Bisexual Clients in Comparison to Lesbian and Gay Clients. *Journal of Bisexuality*, ISSUE AND VOLUME, 1-18.
- Ginicola, M. M., Smith, C., & Filmore, J. M. (Eds.) (2017). *Affirmative, strengths-based counselling with LGBTQI+ people*. Alexandria, VA: American Counseling Association,
- Hicks, C. (2010). Counselling psychology contributions to understanding sexuality. In M. Milton (Ed.), *Therapy and beyond: Counselling psychology contributions to therapeutic and social issues* (pp. 243-258). Chichester, UK: John Wiley & Sons, Ltd..
- Hodges, I. (2011). Queering psychoanalysis: Power, self and identity in psychoanalytic therapy with sexual minority clients. *Psychology & Sexuality*, 2(1), 29-44.
- Johnson, L., & Federman, E. J. (2014). Training, experience, and attitudes of VA psychologists regarding LGBT issues: Relation to practice and competence. *Psychology of Sexual Orientation and Gender Diversity*, 1(1), 10-18.
- McDowell, T., Emerick, P., & Garcia, M. (2014). Queering couple and family therapy education. *Journal of Feminist Family Therapy*, 26(2), 99-112.
- O'Shaughnessy, T., & Speir, Z. (2018). The state of LGBTQ affirmative therapy clinical research: A mixed-methods systematic synthesis. *Psychology of Sexual Orientation and Gender Diversity*, 5(1), 82-98.
- O'Shaughnessy, T., & Spokane, A. (2013). Lesbian and gay affirmative therapy competency, self-efficacy, and personality in psychology trainees. *The Counseling Psychologist*, 41(6), 825-856.

- Shelton, K., & Delgado-Romero, E. A. (2011). Sexual orientation microaggressions: The experience of lesbian, gay, bisexual, and queer clients in psychotherapy. *Journal of Counseling Psychology, 58*(2), 210-221.
- Sherry, A., Whilde, M. R., & Patton, J. (2005). Gay, lesbian, and bisexual training competencies in American Psychological Association accredited graduate programs. *Psychotherapy: Theory, Research, Practice, Training, 42*(1), 116-120.
- Spengler, E. S., Miller, D. J., Spengler, P. M. (2016). Microaggressions: Clinical errors with sexual minority clients. *Psychotherapy, 53*(3), 360-366.
- Steelman, S. M. (2016). Externalizing identities: An integration of narrative therapy and queer theory. *Journal of Family Psychotherapy, 27* (1), 79-84.

Critical Cosmopolitan Citizenship Education and the Ontario Curriculum

Taciana de Lira e Silva
University of Ottawa

Critical cosmopolitan citizenship education is a transformational approach to education that empowers students to become global citizens through active involvement in the local, national and global communities while seeking to build a better world. This study's objective was to inquire about how Ontario's official curriculum guides educators to prepare secondary students (Canadian born and those new to Canada) to become effective citizens of the 21st century. A critical discourse analysis was conducted to investigate the Ontario Ministry of Education's (OME) approach to citizenship education within the frameworks of critical pedagogy and cosmopolitan citizenship education that encourage educators and students to respect human rights and become active citizens who strive towards peace and sustainability. The discourse analysis included two curriculum documents: (1) *The Ontario curriculum grades 9 and 10: Canadian and World Studies* (OME, 2018), which addresses civic education, and (2) *The Ontario Curriculum Grades 9 to 12: English as a Second Language and English Literacy Development* (OME, 2007), which prepares newcomers to improve their English proficiency. The findings confirm that the discourse produced by these documents aims to develop students' understanding of the global world, but does not necessarily prepare them to act for the betterment of the planet. The findings further indicate that citizenship education in the 21st century should dissociate from a nation-centered approach and focus on preparing students for global citizenry.

Keywords: *cosmopolitan citizenship education, critical pedagogy, empowerment, human rights, Ontario curriculum, ESL*

L'éducation à la citoyenneté cosmopolite critique est une approche transformationnelle qui habilite les étudiants à devenir des citoyens du monde qui s'impliquent activement dans les communautés locales, nationales et mondiales tout en cherchant à bâtir un monde meilleur. L'objectif de cette étude était de déterminer les différentes avenues par lequel le programme officiel de l'Ontario guide les éducateurs dans la préparation des élèves du secondaire (nés au Canada et nouveaux au Canada) à devenir des citoyens efficaces du 21^e siècle. Dans le cadre d'une pédagogie critique et d'une éducation à la citoyenneté cosmopolite qui encourage les éducateurs et les étudiants à respecter les droits de l'homme et à devenir des citoyens actifs qui aspirent à la paix et au développement durable, une analyse critique du

discours a été réalisée pour étudier l'approche de l'éducation à la citoyenneté adoptée par le ministère de l'Éducation de l'Ontario (MÉO). L'analyse du discours comprenait deux programmes d'étude: (1) le programme ontarien des 9e et 10e années: Études canadiennes et mondiales (MÉO, 2018), qui traite de l'éducation civique, et (2) le curriculum de l'Ontario, de la 9e à la 12e année: *English as a Second Language and English Literacy Development* (MÉO, 2007), qui prépare les nouveaux arrivants à améliorer leurs compétences en anglais. Les résultats de notre analyse confirment que le discours produit par ces documents vise à développer chez les élèves une compréhension globale du monde, mais ne les prépare pas nécessairement à agir pour le mieux-être de la planète. Les résultats indiquent en outre que l'éducation à la citoyenneté au 21e siècle devrait être dissociée d'une approche centrée sur l'État-nation pour se concentrer sur la formation des élèves à la citoyenneté mondiale.

Mots-clés : *éducation à la citoyenneté cosmopolite, pédagogie critique, empowerment, droits de la personne, programme d'études en Ontario, Anglais langue seconde*

Since 2017, Canada has received “illegal” refugees, many of them children, who had fled wars and hunger in their original countries and sought refuge in the United States of America. As these people were no longer welcome in that country, they decided to seek asylum in Canada; however, Canadian citizens have not been very positive about this situation. According to a poll run by the *Angus Reid Institute* (August 3, 2018,), 67% of Canadians are not satisfied with the influx of illegal immigrants in this country and consider the situation a *crisis*. In Ontario, Premier Doug Ford demanded compensation from the federal government to pay for the care of those who entered the country illegally (Gray & Zilio, 2018). In the midst of such a political and economic crisis, there are human beings who need a home and children who need care and education.

Globalization in the 20th century created issues of human displacement and new financial, cultural, racial, and social relationships in all walks of life (Beck & Sznaider, 2006). In addition, environmental challenges that could lead to the extinction of life on Earth have appropriately become a critical societal concern (Ceballos, Ehrlich, & Dirzo, 2017). Therefore, it is reasonable to expect that education in the 21st century should reflect and respond to these current realities. In order to effectively address these challenges, education that intends to contribute to the betterment of the planet must offer students the tools to learn about global challenges and work towards the protection of human life and the environment. These fundamental principles are defended by Cosmopolitan Citizenship Education (CCE) and Critical Pedagogy (CP). CCE is education for peace, human rights and

sustainability (Nussbaum, 2003). It employs the terms *cosmopolitan* and *citizenship* as it aims to help learners become citizens of the world without giving up their national or local citizenship identity (Nussbaum, 1994). However, cosmopolitan citizens cannot be passive; they need to become critical of reality and work to address injustice and inequity. For this reason, CP is CCE's invaluable partner in the classroom, as an approach to education that seeks to empower individuals to actively engage in civic life (Kincheloe, 2007).

Cosmopolitan Citizenship Education has the potential to be a holistic approach to education that encompasses not only human relationships, but also human-environment interconnections. Environmental education (EE) has the objective of developing the learner's positive attitude and voluntary participation in projects that aim to conserve the environment and natural resources (Bootrach, Thiengkamol, & Thiengkamol, 2015). It nurtures a relationship of respect that is essential for a better quality of life in the social, ecologic and economic ambits (Leblanc, 2018), both locally and globally. Therefore, EE should be integrated into CCE and CP. The amalgamation of these three approaches will enable the learner to understand local, national and global issues and concomitantly work towards the improvement of life on the planet through *conscientização* [conscientization] and *praxis*, which empower learners and educators to identify a problem, devise possible solutions, and act to solve the issue (Freire, 1972).

Democratic education and CP are interconnected educational practices (Apple & Beane, 1995; Freire, 1972; Giroux, 2003; McLaren, 1994) that unveil the political connection between school and society while preparing learners to defend their rights and seek positive change at the national level. I have never encountered an academic work that encompasses CP and CCE, which would prepare learners to seek justice globally. Thus, I have chosen to combine CP and CCE in order to form Critical Cosmopolitan Citizenship Education (CCCE), an approach that empowers teachers and students to work together to better understand human and environmental injustices at local, national and global levels, while trying to find ways to change the status quo. For CCCE to happen, teachers and students need to understand principles of critical pedagogy, sustainability and cosmopolitan education. This critical discourse analysis study aims to identify concepts related to CCCE in two curriculum documents that guide educators to lead Ontario's secondary students in their journey to become effective citizens in society.

Critical Pedagogy

John Dewey is considered the father of *progressive education*, an approach that claims that *thinking* and *doing* should engage students, broaden their learning experience, and prepare them to become active citizens of a democratic society. Dewey (2004/1916) argues that “schools require for their full efficiency more opportunity for conjoint activities in which those instructed take part, so that they may acquire a social sense of their own powers and of the materials and appliances used” (p. 45). In addition, Dewey believed that a democratic society “must have a type of education which gives individuals a personal interest in social relationships and control, and the habits of mind which secure social changes without introducing disorder” (p. 104). Many educational philosophers developed theories that viewed education as a ground-breaking institution for social reforms. Freire, for instance, is considered the educational philosopher who most influenced the development of CP (Darder, Baltodano, & Torres, 2003). In his seminal work, *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*, Freire (1972) explains that there are two types of human beings: oppressed and oppressor; and through empowering the oppressed, social changes can happen in a positive and constructive way. Like Dewey, Freire believed in changes that flourish from peaceful movements, without the use of violence or any other kind of disorder.

In addition to social changes, power can also promote relations of equality between humans and nature to change the present dichotomous worldview that sees the environment as an object to serve humanity. Foucault and Gordon (1980) assert that power is productive in that “it produces things [...], forms of knowledge, [and] produces discourse. It needs to be thought of as a productive network which runs through the whole social body” (p. 119). Foucault did not state that power was good or bad, but that it produces changes. CP fosters a relationship of co-builders of knowledge between teacher and student, empowering the learner to think critically and to try to transform the world (Freire, 1972). Freire explains that if the teacher does not give the learner the opportunity to participate in her/his own learning, knowledge will be *deposited* in the learner’s head and will impede critical thinking and knowledge ownership, creating *oppression*. This is the *banking model* concept, which allows student action only “as far as receiving, filling, and storing the deposits” (p. 58).

Cosmopolitan Citizenship Education

Cosmopolitan citizenship education (CCE) aims to help learners become citizens of the world without giving up their local or national allegiance. In emphasizing a common humanity and human solidarity, cosmopolitanism does not seek to deny local or regional

identifications (Osler, 2011), but to emphasize them. As Nussbaum (1996) and Appiah (2006) note, local identities remain important for cosmopolitans because they can be a source of great richness.

Nussbaum (1994) explains that cosmopolitan citizenship is an approach that was first defended by Diogenes (the cynic) and the Roman stoics. Kant (1903) defended the right of *universal hospitality*, “the claim of a stranger entering foreign territory to be treated by its owner without hostility” (p. 137) and clarified that humans are first and foremost citizens of the world and, thus, have the right to be welcomed by other countries when in need. Throughout history, several social scientists, philosophers of education, and educators (e.g., Banks, 2008; Beck 2000; Dewey, 2004/1916; Habermas, 1996; Held, 1995; Hutchings & Dannruether, 1999; Kaldor, 2003; Osler & Starkey, 2003, 2005; Osler & Vincent, 2002) have identified with the cosmopolitan citizenship approach to education. Osler and Starkey (2005), for example, argue that cosmopolitan citizenship is a status, a feeling, and a practice at all levels, from the local to the global. They explain that “students are holders of inalienable human rights, rather than their presumed status as citizens” (Osler & Starkey, 2011, p. 2). Freedom and equity are not rights bestowed by certain countries, but are rights that should be respected and fought for by the entire global community.

Appadurai (1996) suggests a citizenship approach that is linked to material problems and suggests that it is time to rethink the nation-state patriotism in order to:

allow the material problems we face – the deficit, the environment, abortion, race, drugs, and jobs – to define those social groups and ideas for which we would be willing to live and die [...] Some of us may still want to live – and die – for the United States. But many of these new sovereignties are inherently postnational. (p. 176)

Instead of imposing one type of nationality, state members should be able to choose a cause through which they want to improve life on this planet. Nussbaum (1994) argues that cosmopolitan citizenship should be the central focus of education because it gives individuals the opportunity to learn more about themselves, develop empathy, and work together to solve problems that affect humanity and the environment and that require local, national and international cooperation.

Nevertheless, opposition to the ideal of cosmopolitanism abounds. Pheng Cheah (1998) explains that Marx saw cosmopolitanism as a way of exploiting the world through a

global mode of production and the establishment of international commerce. According to Marx (1848/1973), “the bourgeoisie has through its exploitation of the world market given a *cosmopolitan* character to production and consumption in every country [... as well as] the intellectual creations of individual nations” (p. 71). The father of modern China, Sun Yat-sen (1927) also stood opposed to an independent cosmopolitanism. He insisted that a nation needs to establish a strong nationalism and that “we must understand that cosmopolitanism grows out of nationalism. If nationalism cannot become strong, cosmopolitanism certainly cannot prosper” (p. 89). Taylor (2012) agrees with Sun Yat-sen; he argues that without nationalism humans would not be able to contribute towards a common wellbeing because they would be more focused on their own individual welfare. Taylor explains that two facts influence nationalism. One is identity, which refers to how individuals see themselves in relation to the group; the other is the members’ belief that their participation in society is important. Without *identity* and *belief* there would not be group cohesion and individuals would become more focused on securing their own individual rights. Consequently, for cosmopolitanism to exist, societies should also be nationalistic to some extent.

In 1994, Richard Rorty wrote “The Unpatriotic Academy”, which inspired Nussbaum and other academics to publish the book *For the Love of Country: Debating the Limits of Patriotism* (1996). Rorty (1994) discusses the need for a national identity and a national pride instead of a “politics of difference” (para. 10), which he deems unpatriotic and ineffective. He explains that loyalty to a small group has the potential to motivate individuals to cooperate with the larger group, and further, that it is actually unjust for someone to try to solve universal conflicts while ignoring local ones.

Cheah (1998) depicts Benedict Anderson as the most popular defender of nationalism who believes that it is universalistic, unlike the migrants who keep their bounded political identities. In fact, Anderson (1991) and Tönnies (1957/1887) argue that the principle of nationality is influenced by technology, which under the influence of globalization, has acquired a transnational perspective.

Robbins (1998) believes that nationalism and cosmopolitanism can share a path, because commitment to people’s wellbeing is linked to history and sentiments (e.g., religion, friendship, commercial interests, recognition of unfairness, such as child labor and hunger), not to the abstraction of humanity. However, the reason he opposes cosmopolitanism is because he sees it as an “outgrowth of ideological reflection of global capitalism” (p. 7) that aims to impose a philosophy of western universalism while ignoring individual and group identities.

Cosmopolitan citizenship values and promotes individual, national and global identities and gives citizens the freedom to be involved in citizenship at all levels. Through CCE, students learn to see humanity through the lenses of equity, and respect and protect the environment as everyone's home. Their learning may lead them to want to advocate for peace, human rights and sustainability and CCE will assist them in their journey.

Theoretical Framework

The objective of this study was to conduct a critical discourse analysis of two Ontario curriculum documents: (1) *The Grades 9 and 10: Canadian and World Studies* (OME, 2018), which addresses civic education, and (2) *the Grades 9 to 12: English as a Second Language (ESL) and English Literacy Development (ELD)* (OME, 2007), which prepares newcomers to improve their English proficiency. These two documents were chosen because they affect the learning of every secondary student in Ontario, whether born in Canada or abroad. The *Canadian and World Studies* course is mandatory for all students, while the *ESL – EDL* courses are mandatory for students whose mother tongues are other than English and for “students who speak a variety of English such as those spoken in parts of the Caribbean and Africa” (OME, 2007, p. 21). Although these are not explicitly considered citizenship courses, they constitute newcomer secondary students' first experience with the Canadian educational system.

The theoretical framework used in the study includes CP and CCE, because they embrace principles that can be shared in the classroom to promote critical cosmopolitan citizens who care about humanity and the environment. While analyzing the curriculum documents, I investigate whether the document states expectations instead of suggestions that would give both teacher and student any opportunity to inquire about subjects of their own interest. CP argues that students and teachers need to have the right to choose what to learn for learning to be empowering. In addition, I seek evidence of demonstration of global interdependence instead of only theoretical knowledge that depicts the other as far away and not belonging to the local reality. Cosmopolitan citizenship is inclusive of all levels of citizenship.

Methods

Critical Discourse Analysis

Discourse analyses are part of a critical social analysis approach that views language as an expression of social relations connected to historical contexts, which can be accepted or challenged according to existing social values (Fairclough, 2012). Critical discourse analysis focuses on the correlation between discourse and social elements, such as relations of power (Janks, 1997).

The technical procedure used in this study is based on Chouliaraki and Fairclough's (1999) four stages of discourse analysis, which, according to Fairclough (2012), is a variant of Bashar's explanatory critique. These stages include: "Stage 1: Focus upon a social wrong, in its semiotic aspects. Stage 2: Identify obstacles to addressing the social wrong. Stage 3: Consider whether the social order 'needs' the social wrong. Stage 4: Identify possible ways past the obstacles" (Fairclough, 2012, p. 12).

Stage 1: Focus upon a social wrong, in its semiotic aspects. The present study analyzed two Ontario curriculum documents to identify indications of harmful power dynamics that may contribute to injustice towards racialized newcomers. Fairclough (2012) emphasizes that the researcher must select a topic related to a social wrong "which can productively be approached in a trans-disciplinary way with a particular focus on dialectical relations between semiotic and other 'moments'" (p. 6). Cui (2015), Hall (1992) and Hage's (2000) studies show a concern about the dichotomy of the Canadian educational system that favours white, Canadian born students and hinders newcomers and non-white groups, which are described as social wrongs. In Ontario, curriculum documents are funded and written by the provincial ministry of education. According to Luke (1995), when the government decides what, how and why teachers will educate the students, they retain great power over the educational system. In addition, Apple (1985) asserts that it is necessary to analyze the work of education through a social lens to understand how particular perspectives, methods and "truths" are made available.

Stage 2: Identify obstacles to addressing the social wrong. Once the obstacles were identified, it was necessary to disclose them. Fairclough (2012) explains that the social wrong addresses the ways in which "social life is structured and organized that prevents it from being addressed" (p. 7). Since the Ontario curriculum is written and imposed by the

government that also funds education in the province, they stand very powerful before educators and learners inhibiting any opposing standpoint.

The obstacles to address the social wrong revolve around the powerful political discourse that dominates education and the influence of neoliberalism that sabotages public values and sees education as a way of training students (Giroux, 2014). Like a rhizome that is invasive and difficult to destroy, neoliberalism develops mostly underground, influencing people's social, cultural and professional lives, seeking ultimately to destroy group identity and promote a society that is individualistic, consumerist and competitive (Jones, 2011). This type of society will only promote inequality and conflict, which opposes the fundamental principles of cosmopolitan citizenship.

It is the goal of every government in more developed countries for youth to finish high school and move on to post-secondary education or into the workforce. Students learn from a very young age that without school, there is no future (Ball, Maguire, & Macrae, 2000), so it is difficult to confront a system that exists, in part, to structure each person's life. Many times, the problem begins in elementary school, when students who show poor academic skills begin to feel that they do not belong in that system. When learners do not fit into the educational social order and drop out, society holds them responsible for their choices instead of questioning the structural and institutional constraints facing them (Bourdieu et al., 1999). In addition, they tend to be ostracized by society because they will need assistance to survive, instead of becoming powerful consumers.

Stage 3: Consider whether the social order 'needs' the social wrong. In a globalized economy and society, it would be ideal for members of all races, ethnicities, classes and genders to be treated equally. Indeed, Fairclough (2012) posits that "discourse is ideological in so far as it contributes to sustaining relations of power and domination" (p. 8). When power is used to exert imbalance between the citizens of a country, it promotes social wrongs that damage the social order and need to be addressed and changed. The Ontario educational system has structured education as preparation for the test, which is "instrumental and reductionist" (Giroux, 2014, p. 491) and serves to disempower students and reduce teachers' capabilities to a simple-minded role. This is not an inclusive system because it is developed for the hegemonic group that monopolizes the economy, curbing the possibilities of minority groups to succeed in society. In fact, Ontario schools have seen an increase in violence and reduction of funding to support those who need extra care (Hammond, 2018).

Stage 4: Identify possible ways past the obstacles. According to Fairclough (2012), stage four “moves the analysis from negative to positive critique: identifying, with a focus on dialectical relations between semiosis and other elements, possibilities within the existing social process for overcoming obstacles to addressing the social wrong in question” (p. 8). CP and CCE offer a positive change to education and to citizenship. Through this approach students and teacher are able to nourish critical thinking, inquire, ask questions and become agents of change; education becomes the *berceau* (haven) of “social movements capable of struggling against anti-democratic force” (Giroux, 2014, p. 497) that ignore human rights, peace and environment consciousness.

Document Analysis

This section will present the critical analysis of *The Ontario Curriculum Grades 9 and 10: Canadian and World Studies* (OME, 2018) and *The Ontario Curriculum Grades 9 to 12: English as a Second Language and English Literacy Development* (OME, 2007). I explain the visions of the two documents and how they depict their expectations. I also try to find an indication of strands of CCCE in both documents.

Ontario’s Canadian and World Studies Curriculum

The Ontario curriculum grades 9 and 10: Canadian and World Studies (OME, 2018) suggests that the curriculum “provides opportunities for teachers and students to select, within the broad parameters of the expectations, topics for investigation” (p. 40); however, in the same paragraph, it states that the teacher should plan the learning unit with the “end in mind” and select the “appropriate content, including issues and examples, and ensuring that students develop the knowledge, understanding, and skills to support this end [the planned unit]” (p. 40). At times, it seems the document is giving teachers and students a certain freedom to direct the learning in the classroom; however, upon deeper examination, it is in fact controlling what should happen in the classroom, imposing its goals on youth provincewide who have different worldviews and needs, and forcing students to be mere passive containers of unfamiliar knowledge.

Ontario’s Canadian and World Studies Curriculum for grades 9 and 10 (OME, 2018) incorporates a previous environmental policy entitled: *Acting Today, Shaping Tomorrow: A Policy Framework for Environmental Education in Ontario Schools*. This policy acknowledges the need for all Ontario students to become environmentally responsible and outlines three goals: promoting environmental learning, engaging students to advocate for the

environment, and designating individuals and organizations within the education system to encourage teachers and students to continue their journeys as environmental supporters. The curriculum document does not mention that students need to be involved in activities that promote sustainability in a global scope, but rather, suggests that students are encouraged to “explore a range of environmental issues [related to] Canadian resource management, population growth and urban sprawl, and the impact of human activity on the natural environment” (p. 46). This discourse indicates that students should learn about how global issues affect Canada, but not how Canada affects the world. It does not position Canada as a member of the global community with responsibilities to improve life on Earth (in addition to life in Canada) and help other countries focus on the global wellbeing.

Through a CCCE approach, students and teachers would become aware of a problem (e.g., the global water crisis), and explore aspects such as scarcity and pollution within the local, national and global contexts. Beyond awareness, CCCE would motivate students to extend their investigation to seek understanding of those problems and would encourage them to identify realistic ways of helping improve the situation and prompt them to act.

The stated objective of the Ontario Canadian and World Studies Curriculum as a policy document, which is used to guide to Geography, History and Civics (politics) education, is to “enable students to become responsible, active citizens within the diverse communities to which they belong, as well as becoming critically thoughtful and informed citizens who value an inclusive society” (p. 6). This vision for the three courses contained in the document relies on an understanding of complex terms, including: *active citizenship*, *diversity in communities*, *critical thought*, and *inclusive societies* (concepts which can be interpreted in different ways). The curriculum defines civics education, for example, as “a branch of politics that explores the rights and responsibilities of citizens, the processes of public decision making, and ways in which citizens can act for the common good within communities at the local, national, and/or global level” (p. 12). While Ontario teaches civics education, Starkey (2012) explains that there is a difference between civics and citizenship education. Civics education was introduced in the 19th century with the implementation of an educational focus on the *national state*, dissociating from values such as humanity and cosmopolitanism that had been defended earlier (e.g., by Kant in 1903), and instead promoting nationalism (Dewey, 2004/1916). Starkey (2012) clarifies that citizenship education differs from civics education because it welcomes dialogue and visualizes change occurring through a democratic approach. The OME’s choice of adopting a civics approach to education demonstrates a governmental preference that endorses a nationalist *quizas* (perhaps) patriotic country instead of a more democratic and inclusive one.

The analysis of the first Ontario curriculum document led me to conclude that the curriculum aims to prepare students to become promoters of a common good and to act in the name of others as knowledgeable outsiders. That is, it seems to encourage individuals who theoretically understand someone else's problems to act, instead of bringing the insiders (i.e., those who experience the problem) into the action. This can be problematic because the ideology that drives the out-group's promotion of the common good may not match the in-group's ideology. If the supposedly knowledgeable out-group members do not work with the in-group to find a solution (even if well-intentioned), their decision for the common good could be considered oppressive. Indeed, according to Freire (1972), decisions made by an out-group in a paternalistic manner to help the oppressed without giving them the freedom to decide for themselves does constitute oppressive action. Consequently, learning through *The Ontario Curriculum Grades 9 and 10: Canadian and World Studies* (OME, 2018) may not prepare students to understand and accept *otherness*, but may instead contribute to maintenance of an oppressed-oppressor dynamic within society.

Ontario's ESL – ELD Curriculum

The vision of *The Ontario Curriculum Grades 9 to 12: English as a Second Language and English Literacy Development* (OME, 2007) is that the English language learner acquires the necessary language skills to become a full participant in Canadian society. Although it acknowledges that over 100 different languages are spoken in Ontario's secondary schools, there is no attempt to include this diversity in the teaching and learning process; rather, the emphasis of the courses is on preparing newcomers to participate effectively in the job market. In order to curtail any attempt to deviate from the curricular expectations, and potentially also to demonstrate power over teachers and learners, the document frequently uses words and phrases such as "expected", "essential", "required" and "students will...". For example, "knowledge and skills that students are *expected* to develop and demonstrate in their class work" (p. 15); "structures students are *expected* to learn through work done" (p. 172); "*essential* classroom and school routines and behaviour" (p.126); "skills and work habits *required* for success in the workplace" (p.181); "*students will be expected* to use [...] sources with increasing sophistication" (p. 52) (OME, 2007). The justifications for the goals of the ESL and ELD curriculum (OME, 2007) are:

the belief that broad proficiency in English is essential to students' success in both their social and academic lives and to their ability to take their place in society as responsible and productive citizens. The curriculum is designed to provide English

language learners with the knowledge and skills they need to achieve these goals. (p. 3).

While this statement may be true, the document's almost exclusive focus on this aim overlooks other important topics such as citizenship, cultural and social diversity, and equity of all citizens, producing a hegemonic discourse that indirectly encourages newcomers to master the English language simply in order to acculturate and contribute financially to society.

According to Dewey (2004/1916), a democratic society is formed by continuous interactions of social groups to break down barriers of "class, race, and national territory which [has] kept men from perceiving the full import of their activity" (p. 91). Dewey explains that only education can revoke undemocratic principles and support a democratic society through inclusion and equity. The primary goal of Ontario's ESL – ELD curriculum document (OME, 2007) appears to be to prepare newcomers to participate in the job market, disregarding their right to experience full Canadian citizenship, which allows full participation in social and political domains.

Discussion

The initial review of the two Ontario curriculum documents displayed a lack of education for activism and empowerment to build a better world. New Canadian citizens are not blank slates; they are individuals with their own cultural and social backgrounds who need to adjust to a new culture and society, but who also have a lot to contribute to the betterment of their new home. Cui (2015) explains that if newcomers are not given the opportunity to share their beliefs with the new society, they may never develop a feeling of belonging. If newcomers do not embrace a Canadian identity, they probably won't feel responsible for the country or the people who live here, which could create conflicts with native-born citizens. However, through the CCCE approach, learners can be encouraged to develop thoughtful and positive relationships with their local groups, nation-states, and the global community. In addition, through critical consciousness (Freire, 1972) they will feel empowered to join with other groups to intervene in the world and transform it for the better. I believe this approach would help to counteract the feeling of not belonging to the Canadian society because individuals are treated as members of humanity as a whole and as citizens of the Earth.

The *United Nations Declaration on Human Rights Education and Training* (2011) defines activism as a movement for change that begins with self and includes various levels of human interactions. It distinguishes between education *about* rights (i.e., awareness of the principles of human rights), education *through* rights (i.e., student understanding of their own rights), and education *for* rights (i.e., learner empowerment to use their rights to help others). All forms of education are valid and important; however, education for rights has the capacity to motivate students to try to affect positive change in the world. Ultimately, the Ontario curriculum documents analyzed in this paper focus on education *about* rights and *through* rights, but they fail to empower the students to learn *for* the rights of others.

Conclusion

The internet, scientists, educators and many UN and NGO agencies have revealed the global imbalance of income distribution and nature depredation. While many humans struggle to survive, a minority of wealthy people live a life of luxury and waste. In the name of capitalism, forests are being destroyed, pollution is increasing, and consumption by the rich is being encouraged. This discrepancy needs to end, however, simple awareness of this global and local unfairness will not change reality. Education has a very important role to play in transforming the world into a better place to live. Implementing an educational approach that combines critical pedagogy and cosmopolitan citizenship education will prepare learners to be critical of the *status quo* while learning to advocate for human rights, peace and sustainability. Given these benefits, it is reasonable to assert that the critical cosmopolitan citizenship education approach is the ideal way to overcome global inequities within the ambits of human-human and human-nature relations. It promotes action for the betterment of the world, because knowledge without action does not promote change.

The *critical* part of the CCCE approach empowers students to develop thoughtful and positive relationships with their local communities, nation-states, and the global society to make real change (Freire, 1972). It refutes the idea that individuals should define themselves “within an atomized framework, in which competitiveness is the ever present and overriding goal of all activity” (Copley, 2018, p. 45). As such, CCCE counteracts racism and the feeling of not belonging to the Canadian society, because it promotes a view of all humans as valuable citizens of the world. Although this approach to citizenship may sound utopic, cosmopolitanism has already been adopted by the global society. Examples of cosmopolitanism’s reach include the United Nations, the International Court of Justice, international non-governmental organizations, such as the World Health Organization, and many other transnational organizations. The idea of a cosmopolitan world may not attract

everyone, especially those who believe in a strong and independent nation-state, but I believe adopting a CCCE approach would empower students to target injustices in the local, national and global sphere, and will contribute to a better life on this planet.

This paper's critical discourse analysis of the two Ontario curriculum documents on Canadian and World Studies and ESL – ELD demonstrates a need for the Ontario government to make changes to their approach to citizenship and newcomer language education in order to nurture a peaceful and participatory society. The study further reveals that instead of *civics* education that is normative and limiting, a critical cosmopolitan *citizenship* approach is ideal because it empowers and motivates learners to become active citizens in society. Specifically, the CCCE approach encourages awareness of inequities and active involvement in movements of change, as opposed to remaining apathic to injustice and contributing (even if indirectly) to a world of inequities and war. Indeed, CCCE is a transdisciplinary approach because injustices can be addressed through any subject matter, but especially language. When learning through this approach, newcomers would have the opportunity to share their beliefs, learn from others and become full citizens of Canada and the world, instead of focusing solely on financial success, which could result in selfish, apathetic individuals with no sense of belonging or interest in building a better country or world.

Finally, as this is a theoretical study, the absence of teacher perspectives is a limitation because their understanding of the curriculum has the potential to bring more insight to this inquiry. Although teachers' actions are also controlled by curriculum documents, many are driven by a passion for justice and still find ways to address social, financial, cultural and environmental struggles in the classroom. Sharing their experiences could inspire other teachers to inspire future learners. After all, teachers are the experts who guide student learning and may influence their journey to become effective citizens in society. In order to build on the present study and bridge the gap between theory and practice, future studies aiming to bring in teachers' perspectives (on these and other relevant curriculum documents) are suggested.

References

- Anderson, B. (1991). *Imagined communities: Reflections on the origin and spread of nationalism*. London, UK: Verso.
- Appadurai, A. (1996). *Modernity at large: Cultural dimensions of globalization*. Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press.
- Appiah, K. A. (2006) *Cosmopolitanism: Ethics in a World of Strangers* New York, NY: W. W. Norton & Company.
- Apple, M. W. (1985). *Teachers and texts*. New York, NY: Routledge & Kegan Paul.
- Apple, M. A. & Beane, J. A. (Eds.) (1995). *Democratic schools*. Alexandria, VA: ASCD.
- Ball, S. J., Maguire, M. & Macrae, S. (2000). *Choice, Pathways and Transitions Post-16: New Youth, New Economies in the Global City*. London: RoutledgeFalmer.
- Banks, J. A. (2008). Diversity, group identity, and citizenship education in a global age. *Educational Researcher*, 37(3), 129–139.
- Baxter, P., & Jack, S. (2008). Qualitative case study methodology: Study design and implementation for novice researchers. *The Qualitative Report*, 13(4), 544-559.
- Beck, U. (2000). *What is globalization?* Cambridge, UK: Polity Press.
- Beck, U., & Sznaider, N. (2006). Unpacking cosmopolitanism for the social sciences: a research agenda. *The British Journal of Sociology*, 57(1), 1-23.
- Bourdieu, P., Accardo, A., Balazs, G., Beaud, S., Bonvin, F., & Bourdieu, E. (1999). *The Weight of the World: Social Suffering in Contemporary Society*. Cambridge, UK: Polity Press.
- Bootrach, P., Thiengkamol, N., & Thiengkamol, T. K. (2015). Environmental education strategy. *Applied Environmental Education & Communication*, 14(4), 200-212.
- Cheah, P. (1998). The Cosmopolitical – Today. In Pheng, C. & Bruce, R. (Eds.), *Cosmopolitics, thinking and feeling beyond the nation*. *Cultural Politics* (pp. 20-44). Minneapolis, MN: University of Minneapolis.

- Chouliaraki, L., & Fairclough, N. (1999). *Discourse in late modernity*. Edinburgh, UK: Edinburgh University Press.
- Cui, D. (2015). Capital, distinction, and racialized habitus: Immigrant youth in the educational field. *Journal of Youth Studies*, 18(9), 1154–1169.
- Darder, A, Baltodano, M., & Torres, A. (2003). *The Critical pedagogy reader*. New York, NY: Routledge Falmer.
- Dewey, J. (2004). *Democracy and education*. Mineola, NY: Dover Publications Inc. (Original work published 1916).
- Hammond, S. (2018, January 23). *70% of Ontario elementary teachers personally faced violence in the classroom: Union, Global News*. Retrieved from <https://globalnews.ca/video/rd/1144020035522/?jwsourc=cl>
- Fairclough, N. (2012). Critical discourse analysis. In J. P. Gee & M. Handford (Eds.) *The Routledge handbook of discourse analysis* (pp. 9 – 20). New York, NY: Routledge.
- Foucault, M., & Gordon, C. (1980). *Power/knowledge: Selected interviews and other writings, 1972-1977* (1st American edition). New York, NY: Pantheon Books.
- Freire, P. (1972). *The pedagogy of the oppressed*. New York, NY: The Seabury Press.
- Gray, J. & Zilio, M. (2018, July 5). Ontario, federal government battle over resettling migrants. *The Globe and Mail*. Retrieved from <https://www.theglobeandmail.com/canada/article-ontario-withdraws-support-for-resettlement-of-asylum-seekers-who/>
- Giroux, H. (1983). *Theory & resistance in education: A pedagogy for the opposition*. London, UK: Heinemann.
- Giroux, H. (2014). When Schools Become Dead Zones of the Imagination: a critical pedagogy Manifesto. *Policy futures in education*, 12(4), 491-499.
- Habermas, J. (1996). *Between facts and norms: Contributions to a discourse theory of law and democracy*. Cambridge, UK: Polity Press.

- Hage, G. (2000). *White nation: Fantasies of white supremacy in a multicultural society*. New York, NY: Routledge.
- Hall, S. (1992). The Future of Identity. In T. McGrew & S. Hall (Eds.) *Modernity and Its Futures* (pp. 274–316). Cambridge, UK: Polity Press.
- Held, D. (1995). Democracy and the new international order. In D. Archibugi & D. Held (Eds.) *Cosmopolitan democracy: An agenda for a new world order* (pp. 96–120). Cambridge, UK: Polity Press.
- Hutchings, K. & Dannruether, R. (Eds.) (1999). *Cosmopolitan citizenship*. Basingstoke, UK: Macmillan.
- Janks, H. (1997). Critical discourse analysis as a research tool. *Discourse: Studies in the Cultural Politics of Education*, 18(3), 329-342.
- Jones, O. (2011). *Chavs: The demonization of the working class*. London, UK: Verso.
- Kaldor, M. (2003). American power: From ‘compellance’ to cosmopolitanism? *International Affairs*, 79(1), 1–22.
- Kant, I. (1903). *Perpetual peace: A philosophical essay, 1795*. London: S. Sonnenschein. (Original work published 1795).
- Kincheloe, J. (2007). Critical pedagogy in the 21st century: Evolution for survival. In P. McLaren & J. Kincheloe (Eds.). *Critical pedagogy: Where are we now?* (pp. 147-183), New York, NY: Peter Lang.
- Marx, K. (1973). *Manifesto of the Communist Party, The Revolutions of 1848: Political writings, 1*. Harmondsworth: Penguin (Original work published in 1848).
- McLaren, P. (1994). *Life in schools: An introduction to critical pedagogy in the foundations of education*. New York, NY: Longman.
- Leblanc, Raymond (2018). *La qualité de vie pour tous*. Unpublished manuscript, Department of Education, University of Ottawa, Ottawa, Canada.
- Luke, A. (1995). Text and discourse in education: An introduction to critical discourse analysis. *Review of Research in Education*, 21(1), 3-48.

- Ontario Ministry of Education. (2007). *The Ontario curriculum grades 9 to 12: English as a second language and English literacy development*, Retrieved from <http://www.edu.gov.on.ca/eng/curriculum/secondary/esl912currb.pdf>
- Nussbaum, M. (1994, October 1). Patriotism and cosmopolitanism. *Boston Review: A Political and Literary Forum*. Retrieved from <http://bostonreview.net/martha-nussbaum-patriotism-and-cosmopolitanism>
- Nussbaum, M. (1996). *For love of country: Debating the limits of patriotism*. Boston, MA: Beacon Press.
- Nussbaum, M. (2003). Capabilities as fundamental entitlements: Sen and social justice. *Feminist Economics*, 9(2-3), 33-59.
- Ontario Ministry of Education. (2018). *The Ontario curriculum grades 9 and 10: Canadian and World Studies*.
- Osler, A. (2011). Teacher interpretations of citizenship education: National identity, cosmopolitan ideals, and political realities. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 43(1), 1-24.
- Osler, A., & Starkey, H. (2005). *Changing citizenship: Democracy and inclusion in education*. Maidenhead, UK: Open University Press.
- Osler, A., & Starkey, H. (2003). Learning for cosmopolitan citizenship: Theoretical debates and young people's experiences. *Educational Review*, 55(3), 243-254.
- Osler, A., & Vincent, K. (2002). *Citizenship and the challenge of global education*. Stokeon-Trent, UK: Trentham.
- Robbins, B. (1998). Actually existing cosmopolitanism. In P. Cheah & B. Robbins (Eds.), *Cosmopolitics: Thinking and feeling beyond the nation: Vol. 14 Cultural politics* (pp. 1-19). Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press.
- Rorty, R. (1994, February 13). The unpatriotic academy. *New York Times*. Retrieved from: <https://www.nytimes.com/1994/02/13/opinion/the-unpatriotic-academy.html>
- Starkey, H. (2012). Human rights, cosmopolitanism and utopias: Implications for citizenship education. *Cambridge Journal of Education*, 42(1), 21-35.

Sun, Yat-sen. (1927). *San Min Chu I [The three principles of the people]*. Shanghai, China: Committee Institute of Pacific Relations.

Taylor, C. (2012). Why democracy needs patriotism. In M. Nussbaum & J. Cohen (Eds.), *For the love of Country* (pp. 119-121). Boston, MS: Beacon Press.

Tönnies, F. (1957). *Community and society*. East Lansing, MI: Michigan State University Press (Original work published in 1887).

Angus Reid Institute. (2018, August 3). *Two-thirds call irregular border crossings a 'crisis,' more trust Scheer to handle issue than Trudeau*. Retrieved from <http://angusreid.org/safe-third-country-asylum-seekers/>

United Nations, General Assembly. (2011). *United Nations declaration on human rights education and training*. Retrieved from <https://www.ohchr.org/en/issues/education/training/pages/undheducationtraining.aspx>

CONTRIBUTEURS / CONTRIBUTORS

Fiona Cooligan

Fiona Cooligan completed her Bachelor of Arts in Human Rights and Psychology at Carleton University and is currently pursuing graduate studies in Education at the University of Ottawa. For her MA thesis research, she has examined the various facets of student engagement and co-created learning in higher education. Drawing from her professional background in youth voice in the mental health system, she plans to continue on to her PhD to focus on citizenship and democratic education in the youth sector.

Fiona Cooligan a terminé son baccalauréat ès arts en droits de la personne et en psychologie à l'Université Carleton. Elle poursuit actuellement des études supérieures en éducation à l'Université d'Ottawa. Pour sa thèse de maîtrise, elle s'est intéressée aux différentes facettes de l'engagement des étudiants et de la co-création des apprentissages aux cycles supérieurs. S'appuyant sur son expérience professionnelle à l'écoute des jeunes au sein du système de santé mentale, elle poursuivra son doctorat afin de focaliser sur l'éducation à la citoyenneté démocratique auprès des jeunes.

Lauren Delcourt

Lauren Delcourt received her Bachelor of Education from McGill University and Master of Education from the University of Ottawa in teaching and learning. Particular interest in French second language education has focused her research and further studies in additional qualification courses. She teaches in the Ottawa Carleton District School Board across various grade levels in Core French and French Immersion programs.

Lauren Delcourt est titulaire d'un baccalauréat en éducation de l'Université McGill et d'une maîtrise en éducation de l'Université d'Ottawa, en enseignement et en apprentissage. Son intérêt particulier pour l'enseignement du français langue seconde est fondé sur ses recherches et ses études complémentaires menées dans le cadre de cours qualifiants. Elle enseigne les programmes de français de base et d'immersion française au sein du conseil scolaire du district d'Ottawa-Carleton.

Rana Elbeshbeishy

Rana Elbeshbeishy is a medical doctor from Egypt working as an academic staff member in the Faculty of Medicine at the University of Ottawa. She earned her MD, M.Sc. and PhD from the Faculty of Medicine in Egypt. She worked previously as professor of anatomy and

INFORMATION

embryology at Faculties of Medicine in Egypt and Saudi Arabia. For more than 25 years, she has taught medical students and other health practitioners and has several publications related to medicine. She was an Oncologist before she shifted to teaching, which she loves most as it was always her passion to help students. She feels happy when she receives their feedback telling her that her teaching was a keystone that pushed them to excel.

Rana Elbeshbeishy est une médecin d'Égypte qui fait partie du personnel académique de la Faculté de médecine de l'Université d'Ottawa. Elle a obtenu son M.D., M.Sc. et son doctorat de la Faculté de médecine en Égypte. Elle a déjà travaillé en tant que professeur d'anatomie et d'embryologie aux facultés de médecine en Égypte et en Arabie saoudite. Pendant plus de 25 ans, elle a enseigné à des étudiants en médecine et à d'autres praticiens de la santé tout en faisant paraître plusieurs publications au sujet de la médecine. Elle était oncologue avant de se consacrer à l'enseignement – ce qu'elle aime le plus – car elle a toujours eu la passion d'aider les étudiants. Elle est heureuse lorsqu'elle reçoit des commentaires provenant d'étudiants qui lui soulignent que son enseignement les a conduits à exceller.

Raphaël Gani

Raphaël Gani est étudiant au doctorat en éducation à l'Université d'Ottawa. Boursier FRQSC et BÉSO, il termine sa thèse qui retrace l'histoire du premier partenariat “égalitaire” entre francophones, anglophones et autochtones pour la conception d'un curriculum au Canada.

Raphaël Gani is pursuing is Ph.D in education at the University of Ottawa. Funded by the FRQSC and OGS, he is now finishing is thesis on the first “equal” partnership between Francophone, Anglophone, and Indigenous representatives to design a curriculum in Canada.

Billie Jane Hermosura

Billie Jane Hermosura is a dietitian and PhD candidate at the University of Ottawa. She combines her passion for health, adult learning and project management through her work as a consultant and researcher. Before starting her PhD, Billie Jane worked as a project manager and program evaluation specialist for provincial and regional health authorities in British Columbia. Her research currently focuses on investigating the relationship between competency-based education and health workforce planning. Billie Jane earned a Master of Applied Science from the University of Guelph and a Master of Adult Education from St. Francis Xavier University.

INFORMATION

Billie Jane Hermosura est diététiste et candidate au doctorat à l'Université d'Ottawa. Par son travail de consultante et de chercheure, elle combine sa passion pour la santé, l'apprentissage à l'âge adulte ainsi que la gestion de projets. Avant d'amorcer son doctorat, Billie Jane a occupé les postes de gestionnaire de projet et de spécialiste en évaluation de programme auprès des responsables de la santé provinciale et régionale en Colombie-Britannique. Ses recherches portent actuellement sur la relation entre l'éducation basée sur les compétences et la formation du personnel en santé. Billie Jane a obtenu une maîtrise en sciences appliquées de l'Université de Guelph ainsi qu'une maîtrise en éducation des adultes à la St. Francis Xavier University.

Erin Roach

Erin Roach is a 2nd year M.Ed. student in the Counselling Psychology program at uOttawa. Erin is currently completing her internship, focusing on counselling with LGBTQ+ clients, as well as working within an anti-oppression framework.

Erin Roach poursuit sa deuxième année de maîtrise en éducation à l'Université d'Ottawa au sein du programme de psychologie du counseling. Elle termine son stage axé sur le counseling des clients LGBTQ + en s'inspirant d'une approche anti-oppressive.

Taciana de Lira e Silva

Taciana de Lira e Silva is a doctoral student at Ottawa University in the field of Education, concentration in Societies, Languages and Cultures. She holds a M.Ed. in intercultural education, from Queen's University, a M.S.T. from SUNY Potsdam, and a LL.D. from the Universidade Federal de Pernambuco (Brazil). She was an elementary Core French teacher for eight years and her teaching experience has led her to seek language teaching approaches that provide students with tools that will help them prepare to live in a diverse world. Her research interest is empowering L2 teachers through Critical Cosmopolitan Citizenship Education (Critical as in Critical Pedagogy).

Taciana de Lira e Silva est doctorante en éducation à l'Université d'Ottawa au sein de la spécialisation en sociétés, langues et cultures. Elle est titulaire d'une maîtrise en éducation interculturelle de l'Université Queen's, ainsi qu'un M.S.T. de SUNY Potsdam, et d'un LL.D. de l'Universidade Federal de Pernambuco (Brésil). Son expérience en tant qu'enseignante de français au primaire pendant huit ans l'a mené à s'intéresser aux approches d'enseignement des langues qui fournissent aux étudiants des outils qui les aideront à se préparer à vivre dans un monde diversifié. Ses recherches portent sur l'émancipation des enseignants en langue seconde par le biais de l'éducation cosmopolite critique à la citoyenneté (inspiré de la pédagogie critique).

Christine Suurtamm

Christine Suurtamm is a Full Professor of Mathematics Education and teaches in the areas of mathematics education, assessment and qualitative research. Her research focuses on the complexity of teachers' classroom practice. Dr. Suurtamm is Director of the Pi Lab, a research facility supported by the Canada Foundation for Innovation. She is also the recipient of several teaching and research awards including Excellence in Teaching, the Capital Educator's Award and the University of Ottawa Excellence in Education Award. She is currently the Vice-Dean Research and Professional Development in the Faculty of Education at the University of Ottawa.

Christine Suurtamm est professeure titulaire d'éducation aux mathématiques et elle enseigne la didactique des mathématiques, l'évaluation des apprentissages ainsi que la recherche qualitative. Ses recherches portent sur la complexité des pratiques enseignantes en classe. Dr. Suurtamm est directrice du Pi Lab, une unité de recherche soutenue par la Fondation canadienne pour l'innovation. Elle a également reçu plusieurs prix d'enseignement et de recherche, notamment celui d'excellence en enseignement, le prix des éducateurs de la capitale ainsi que le prix d'excellence en éducation de l'Université d'Ottawa. Elle occupe actuellement le poste de vice-doyenne à la recherche et au développement professionnel à la Faculté d'éducation de l'Université d'Ottawa.

CONTACT

ÉQUIPE ÉDITORIALE / EDITORIAL TEAM

Fiona Cooligan



Raphaël Gani



Billie Jane Hermosura



POUR SOUMMETRE UNE ARTICLE OU UNE DEMANDE /
TO SUBMIT AN ARTICLE OR AN INQUIRY

CONTACT

Actes du SJPD-JPDS Proceedings:

<https://uottawa.scholarsportal.info/ottawa/index.php/sjpd-jpds/index>

Faculté d'éducation / Faculty of Education
Université d'Ottawa / University of Ottawa
Lamoureux Hall (LMX)
145 Jean-Jacques-Lussier Private, # 143.
Ottawa, Ontario, CANADA, K1N 6N5

